



# Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences (KNAW) KONINKLIJKE NEDERLANDSE AKADEMIE VAN WETENSCHAPPEN

## Introduction. What's Left Behind

Eickhoff, Martijn; Ensel, Remco; Derks, Marjet; Meens, Floris

### **published in**

What's Left Behind  
2015

### **document version**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

### **document license**

CC BY

[Link to publication in KNAW Research Portal](#)

### **citation for published version (APA)**

Eickhoff, M., Ensel, R., Derks, M., & Meens, F. (2015). Introduction. What's Left Behind: The Lieux de Mémoire of Europe beyond Europe. In M. Derks, M. Eickhoff, R. Ensel, & F. Meens (Eds.), *What's Left Behind: The Lieux de Mémoire of Europe beyond Europe* (pp. 9-22). Uitgeverij Vantilt.

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the KNAW public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the KNAW public portal.

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

### **E-mail address:**

[pure@knaw.nl](mailto:pure@knaw.nl)

# Notes

---

What's Left Behind. *Lieux de Mémoire* of Europe beyond Europe [p. 9]

---

1 J. Frank, *Dostoevsky. The stir of liberation, 1860-1865* (Princeton, 1986), 372.

2 Quoted by Frank, *Dostoevsky*, 376.

3 F. Dostoevsky, *Winter Notes on Summer Impressions* (Richmond, 2008); Frank, *Dostoevsky, 179-196*, 233-248.

4 J. Huizinga, *Amerika dagboek, 14 april-19 juni 1926*. Bezorgd door Anton van der Lem (Amsterdam, 1993).

5 C. von Schmidt-Phiseldek, *Europa und Amerika, oder die künftigen Verhältnisse der civilisirten Welt* (Kopenhagen, 1832 2nd edition).

6 Evelyn Waugh, 'The American Epoch in the Catholic Church', *Life Magazine* (19 September 1949).

7 P. Rietbergen, *Europe, A Cultural History* (London, 1998; 2013 3rd edition) 428-430.

8 *Ibidem*, 432.

9 P. Nora (ed.), *Les Lieux de Mémoire*, 7 vls. (Paris, 1984-1992); H.L. Wesseling et al. (eds.), *Plaatsen van Herinnering*, 4 vls.

(Amsterdam, 2005); E. François and H. Schulze (eds.), *Deutsche Erinnerungsorte*, 3 vls. (München, 2001-2003); J. Tollebeek et al. (eds.), *België, een parcours van herinnering*, 2 vls. (Amsterdam, 2008).

10 The original French project included 'major sites' (the Eiffeltower), role models (Joan of Arc), books (Proust's *In Remembrance of Things Lost*) as well as topoi (*Mourir pour la patrie*, 'Give up one's life for his country') and institutions (the Archives).

11 See for mnemonic communities: E. Zerubavel, *Time Maps. Collective Memory and the Social Shape of the Past* (Chicago/London, 2003).

12 S. Vanagt, 'Kigali: Kamp Kigali. De dood van tien Belgen', in *België. Een parcours van herinnering*. Deel 2: *Plaatsen van tweedracht, crisis en nostalgie*, eds. J. Tollebeek et al. (Amsterdam, 2008), 310-321; M. Couttenier, 'Tervuren. Het museum. Het spel van ver-

geten en herinneren.' in: *Ibid.* 308-319; M. Bloembergen, 'Amsterdam, 'Het Van Heutszmonument. Het Nederlandse koloniale geheugen.' in *Plaatsen van herinnering. Nederland in de twintigste eeuw*, ed. W. den Doel, (Amsterdam, 2005), 72-87; A. van Stipriaan, 'Suri-name. Somerszorg. De plantages.' in *Plaatsen van herinnering. Nederland in de zeventiende en de achttiende eeuw*, ed. M. Prak (Amsterdam, 2006), 400-411.

13 For such an approach, see for example: P. Steinz, *Made in Europe. De kunst die ons continent bindt* (Amsterdam, 2014).

14 G. Delanty, 'The European Heritage from a Critical Cosmopolitan Perspective', in *Europe in Question* no. 19 (2010) on: <http://www.lse.ac.uk/europeanInstitute/LEQS/LEQSPaper19b.pdf>.

15 M. Espagne and M. Werner, 'Deutsch-Französischer Kulturtransfer im 18. Und 19. Jahrhundert. Zu einem neuen interdisziplinären Forschungsprogramm des CNRS', in *Francia* 13 (1985), 502-510.

16 P. Burke, 'Translating Knowledge, Translating Cultures', in *Kultureller Austausch in der frühen Neuzeit* ed. M. North (Cologne-Weimar-Vienna, 2009) 69-7, as quoted in T. DaCosta Kaufmann and M. North, 'Introduction – Artistic and Cultural Exchanges between Europe and Asia 1400-1900. Rethinking Markets, Workshops and Connections', in *Mediating Netherlandish Art and Material Culture in Asia*, eds. *ibid.* (Amsterdam, 2014), 1-8, there 2.

17 This concept was introduced by S. W. Mintz: *Sweetness and power: the place of sugar in modern history* (Harmondsworth, 1986). Also: P. van Dam, 'Vervlochten geschiedenis. Hoe histoire croisée de natiestaat temt', in *Tijdschrift voor geschiedenis* 125/1 (2012), 96-109.

18 DaCosta Kaufmann and North, 'Introduction', 1-8.

19 A.L. Smith, *Colonial Memory and Postcolonial Europe. Maltese Settlers in Algeria and France* (Bloomington, 2006), 32.

20 Ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, *Greek Colonisation: An Account of Greek Colonies and Other Settlements Overseas* vol. II (Leiden/Boston, 2008); Ed. Saskia T. Roselaar, *Processes of Cultural Change and Integration in the Roman world* (Leiden/Boston, 2015).

- 21 P. Rietbergen, *Europa's India. Fascinatie en cultureel imperialisme, circa 1750-circa 2000* (Nijmegen, 2007).
- 22 Eds. F. Trivellato, L. Halevi & C. Antunes, *Religion and Trade: Cross-Cultural Exchanges in World History, 1000-1900* (Oxford/New York, 2014).
- 23 M.L. Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London 1992) 4. For an introduction in this concept, see: Eds. B. Ashcroft, G. Griffiths and H. Tiffin, *Post-Colonial Studies. The Key Concepts*. 2. Edition (Abingdon, 2007), 48-49.
- 24 I. Sengupta, 'Locating lieux de memoire: A (post)colonial perspective', in *Memory, History and Colonialism. Engaging with Pierre Nora in Colonial and Postcolonial Contexts*, ed. I. Sengupta, German Historical Institute London – Bulletin, Suppl. 1 (London 2009), 1-8, there 8.
- 25 D. Chakrabarty, *Provincializing Europe. Post-colonial Thought and Difference*. Revised edition (Princeton, 2008), 17-46.
- 26 S. Legêne and H. Schulte Nordholt, 'Introduction: Imagining Heritage and Heritage as Imagined History', in *Sites, Bodies and Stories. Imagining Indonesian History*, eds. S. Legêne, Bambang Purwanto and H. Schulte Nordholt (Singapore 2015), 1-30, there 8-9.
- 27 Eds. R. Vogt, W. Cristaudo & A. Leutsch, *European National Identities: Elements, Transitions, Conflicts* (New Brunswick/London, 2014).
- 28 Eds. E. Toguslu, J. Leman & I. Mesut Sezgin, *New Multicultural identities in Europe. Religion and Ethnicity in Secular Societies* (Leuven, 2014); Eds. M. Pakier and B. Strâth, *A European Memory? Contested Histories and Politics of Remembrance* (New York/Oxford, 2010).
- 29 K. Adler, 'EU solidarity damaged by splits on migrants and Greece', [bbc.co.uk.com](http://bbc.co.uk.com), 6 June 2015.

## I Colonial Memory

---

The Conqueror and the Archive; Social Struggles and Practices of Memorialization in Viceregal New Spain  
[p. 26]

---

- 1 'On the Trail of Hernán Cortés: A Journey into a Past Most Mexicans Would Rather Forget', *The Economist*. Retrieved from <http://www.economist.com/news/christmas-specials/21636686-journey-past-most-mexicans-would-rather-forget-trail-hern-n>. See also: M.M. Carrera, *Traveling from New Spain to Mexico: Mapping Practices of Nineteenth-Century Mexico* (Durham, 2011), 232-244.
- 2 P. Nora, 'Between Memory and History: *Les Lieux de Mémoire*', *Representations* 26 (1989), 7-24, 23.
- 3 Seville also takes an important place in my own memories of Peter. On one splendid summer afternoon, we met on the river Guadalquivir to discuss the progress of my master thesis and drink *tinto de verano*. Living history and talking about the future, we laid the basis for a lasting friendship.
- 4 G. Jansses, 'Los lugares de memoria archivística europea: un reconocimiento del recorrido', *Pliegos de Yuste: revista de cultura y pensamiento europeos* 1 (2010): 83-90, 87.
- 5 M. Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory*, trans. L. Cosner (Chicago, 1992), 48.
- 6 B. Carceles de Gea, 'La "justicia distributiva" en el siglo XVII (Aproximación político-constitucional)', *Chronica Nova* 14 (1985): 93-122.
- 7 J. Derrida, *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*, trans. E. Prenowitz (Chicago / London, 1995), 1.
- 8 A.L. Stoler, 'Colonial Archives and the Arts of Governance', *Archival Science* 2 (2002): 87-109.
- 9 A. Erll, 'Remembering Across Time, Space, and Cultures: Premediation, Remediation, and the "Indian Mutiny"', in *Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory*, eds. A. Erll and A. Rigney (Berlin / New York, 2009), 109-38, 111.
- 10 J.E. Lemon, 'The Encomienda in Early New Spain' (Ph.D. diss, Emory University, 2000), 76-81.

- 11 A particularly insightful study of the role of knowledge in the administration of Spain's overseas empire is: A. Brendecke, *Imperium und Empirie: Funktionen des Wissens in der spanischen Kolonialherrschaft* (Köln, 2009).
- 12 See, for example: 'Instrucción a Antonio de Mendoza. Barcelona. 25 April 1535', in *Los virreyes españoles en América durante el gobierno de la casa de Austria, México*, eds. L. Hanke and C. Rodríguez, vol. 1 (Madrid, 1976-1978), 22-31.
- 13 'Cedula que manda, que los Oidores no cometan las informaciones de servicios a los secretarios, sino que ellos las hagan personalmente, y las hagan de los que tuvieren habilidad de meritos y servicios. Madrid. 10 November 1578', in *Cedulario indiano*, ed. A. García Gallo, vol. 2 (Madrid, 1945), 180.
- 14 'Leyes y ordenanza nuevamente hechas por S.M. para la gobernación de las Indias, y buen tratamiento y conservación de los indios', in *Colección de documentos para la historia de México*, ed. J. G. Icazbalceta, vol. 2 (Mexico City, 1858-1866), 204-227, 221.
- 15 See, for example: L.E. Matthew and M.R. Oudijk, eds., *Indian Conquistadores: Indigenous Allies in the Conquest of Mesoamerica* (Norman, 2007).
- 16 Illustrative are the *relacion de méritos y servicios* that Bernal Díaz del Castillo filed in 1538 and the 1618 case of his great grandson, Francisco de Barrios León, in which it reappeared: Archivo General de Indias, Patronato, 55, N.5, R.3 and Patronato, 87, N.2, R.1. Compare also: R. Folger, *Writing as Poaching: Interpellation and Self-Fashioning in Colonial relaciones de méritos y servicios* (Leiden / Boston, 2011).
- 17 F. López de Gómara, *Historia general de las Indias y todo lo acaesido en ellas desde que se ganaron hasta agora y la conquista de Mexico, y de la Nueva España* (1553); B. Díaz del Castillo, *Historia verdadera de la conquista de la Nueva España* (1568); J. Suárez de Peralta, *Tratado del descubrimiento de las Indias* (1589).
- 18 B. Dorantes de Carranza, *Sumaria relación de las cosas de la Nueva España: con noticia individual de los conquistadores y primeros pobladores españoles*, ed. Ernesto de la Torre Villar, (Mexico City, 1987).
- 19 M. Harris, *Aztecs, Moors, and Christian: Festivals of Reconquest in Mexico and Spain* (Austin, 2000), 117-122.
- 20 B. Yun Casalilla, *Marte contra Minerva: el precio del imperio español, c. 1450-1600* (Barcelona, 2004), 429-435. See also: L. Weckmann, *La herencia medieval de México*, vol. 1 (Mexico City, 1984), 176.
- 21 Compare, for example: J. Rodríguez-Velasco, *El debate sobre la caballería en el siglo xv: la tratadística caballeresca castellana en su marco europeo* (Valladolid, 1996).
- 22 'Relación del Marqués de Montesclaros. Mexico. 2 July 1607', in *Los virrey españoles en América durante el gobierno de la casa de Austria. México*, eds. L. Hanke and C. Rodríguez, vol. 2 (Madrid, 1977), 276-284, 282.
- 23 Scholarship on creole identities is vast. For a useful overview of current scholarship see, for example: J.M. Vitulli and D.M. Solodkow, 'Ritmos diversos y secuencias plurales: hacia una periodización del concepto "criollo" in *Poéticas de lo criollo: La transformación del concepto criollo en las letras hispanoamericanas (siglos XVI-XIX)*, eds. J.M. Vitulli and D. M. Solodkow, (Buenos Aires, 2009), 9-58.
- 24 'Relación del Marqués de Montesclaros. Mexico. 2 July 1607', in *Los virrey españoles*, eds. L. Hanke and C. Rodríguez, vol. 2 (Madrid, 1977), 276-284, 281.
- 25 'Carta del Conde de Monterrey sobre el gobierno eclesiástico. Mexico. 31 April 1604', in *Los virrey españoles en América durante el gobierno de la casa de Austria. México*, eds. L. Hanke and C. Rodríguez, vol. 2 (Madrid, 1977), 216-230.
- 26 Dorantes de Carranza, *Sumaria relación de las cosas de la Nueva España*, 51-62; 77-83.

---

The Scent of the Orient. The Prehistory of Poiret's Perfume 'Aladin'  
[p. 33]

---

- 1 C. Mayer Lefkowitz, *Paul Poiret and his Rosine perfumes* (New York 2007), p. 113.
- 2 See: M. Abdel-Halim, *Antoine Galland, sa vie et son œuvre* (Paris, 1964); Abdel-Halim made a typescript of large extracts from Galland's correspondence; for the textual history and reception of the *Thousand and one nights*,

see: U. Marzolph and R. van Leeuwen, eds., *The Arabian nights encyclopedia*, 2 vols. (Santa Barbara, 2004).

3 F. Bauden and R. Waller, eds., *Le journal d'Antoine Galland (1646-1715); la période Parisienne; volume 1 (1708-1709)* (Leuven, 2011), p. 321.

4 H. Zotenberg, *Histoire d'Alâ al-Dîn, ou, La lampe merveilleuse. Texte arabe avec une notice sur quelques manuscrits des Mille et une nuits* (Paris, 1888).

5 N. Vassallo and J. Flores, eds., *Goa and the Great Mughal* (Lisbon/London, 2011).

6 R. van Leeuwen, 'The iconography of the *Thousand and one nights* and modernism: from text to image', [www.revue-relief.org/index.php/relief/article/viewFile/546/680](http://www.revue-relief.org/index.php/relief/article/viewFile/546/680), 2010; see also about an influential exhibition of Islamic art: A. Lerner and A. Shalem, eds., *After one hundred years; the 1910 exhibition 'Meisterwerke muhammedanischer Kunst' reconsidered* (Leiden/Boston, 2010).

7 J. Kr. Andersen and L. Emerek, *Aladdin-Noureddin traditionen I det 19. Århundred; bidrag til en strukturel litteraturhistorie* (København, 1972); L. Gottlieb, *Modernisme; maleriet fornyelse 1918-41* (Aarhus, 2012), pp. 35-9.

8 D. Paulvé and M. Chesnais, *Les Mille et une nuits et les enchantements du docteur Mardrus* (Paris, 2004); G. Bernier, *La revue blanche; ses amis, ses aristes* (Paris, 1991).

9 D. Jullien, *Les amoureux de Schéhérazade; variations modernes sur les Mille et une nuits* (Genève, 2009).

10 M.E. Davis, *Ballets russes style; Diaghilev's dancers and Paris fashion* (London, 2010); C. Spencer, *Leon Bakst* (New York, 1973).

11 P. White, *Poiret* (London, 1973).

---

The Horror of Adwa and the Glory of Adua. Monuments of the Young Italian Nation-State in the Scramble for Africa  
[p. 40]

---

1 Open Letter of the 'Landeskommandant' of the Südtiroler Schützenbund, Paul Bacher, to The President of the Republic of Ethiopia Mr. Girma Woldegiorgis The Prime Minister of the Republic of Ethiopia Mr. Meles Zenawi, published on <http://www.schuetzen.com/> June 25, 2008.

2 E. Packham, *Africa in War and Peace* (Hauppauge, NY, 2004), 4-5.

3 'Austrians in Italy call for removal of Fascist icons linked to Ethiopia', <http://ethiome.com/all/6185.html>, 10-06-2008.

4 'Austrians in Italy call for removal of Fascist icons linked to Ethiopia', <http://ethiome.com/all/6185.html>, 10-06-2008.

5 J. Davis, ed., *Italy in the Nineteenth Century* (Oxford, 2000).

6 A. Körner, *Politics of Culture in Liberal Italy. From Unification to Fascism* (New York, 2009), 1-20.

7 B. Tobia, *Una patria per gli Italiani: Spazi, itinerari, monumenti nell'Italia unita* (Rome, 1991); I. Porciani, *Una festa per la nazione: Rappresentazione dello Stato e spazi sociali nell'Italia unita* (Bologna, 1997); M. Isnenghi, ed., *I luoghi della memoria. Simboli e miti dell'Italia unita* (Rome, 1996).

8 T. Filesi, 'Conferenza di Berlino e colonialismo Italiano (1884-1885)', *Storia Contemporanea* 16 (1985), 5-6, 867-903.

9 P. Milkias and G. Metaferia, eds., *The Battle of Adwa: Reflections on Ethiopia's Historic Victory against European Colonialism* (New York, 2005), 21-35; R. Jonas, *The Battle of Adwa: African Victory in the Age of Empire* (Cambridge, 2011), 9-48.

10 In 1925, the monument was replaced at the Viale delle Terme di Diocleziano because of the expansion of the train station.

11 K. von Henneberg, 'Monuments, Public Space, and the Memory of Empire in Modern Italy', *History and Memory* 16 (2004): 37-85.

12 A. Triulzi, 'Adwa: from monument to document', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan, (Bern, 2005), 143-163.

13 R. Jonas, *The Battle of Adwa: African Victory in the Age of Empire* (Cambridge, 2011), 9-48.

14 P. Milkias and G. Metaferia, eds., *The Battle of Adwa. Reflections on Ethiopia's historic victory against European colonialism* (New York, 2007), 64-65.

15 M. Choat, *Emigrant nation: the making of Italy abroad* (Cambridge, MA, 2008), 37-39.

16 P. Milkias and G. Metaferia, eds., *The Battle of Adwa. Reflections on Ethiopia's historic victory against European colonialism* (New York, 2007), 21-35.

- 17 R. Jonas, *The Battle of Adwa: African Victory in the Age of Empire* (Cambridge, 2011), 304.
- 18 G. Finaldi, *Italian National Identity in the Scramble for Africa. Italy's African Wars in the Era of Nation-building, 1870-1900* (Bern, 2009), 295-298.
- 19 V. Caruso and I. Domenico, *Il monumento alla batteria Masotto e alle batterie siciliane, Adua 1 marzo 1896* (Messina, 2014).
- 20 V. Caruso and I. Domenico, *Il monumento alla batteria Masotto e alle batterie siciliane, Adua 1 marzo 1896* (Messina, 2014).
- 21 V. Caruso and I. Domenico, *Il monumento alla batteria Masotto e alle batterie siciliane, Adua 1 marzo 1896* (Messina, 2014).
- 22 B. Vigezzi, *Politica estera e opinione pubblica in Italia dall'Unità ai giorni nostri. Orientamenti degli studi e prospettive della ricerca* (Milan, 1991), 67-75.
- 23 C. Stephenson, *A box of sand. The Italo-Ottoman War 1911-1912* (Ticehurst, 2014), 11-29; A. Baldinetti, *The Origins of the Libyan Nation. Colonial legacy, exile and the emergence of a new nation-state* (Abingdon, 2010), 27-52.
- 24 A. Triulzi, 'Adwa: from monument to document', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan (Bern, 2005), 143-163.
- 25 B. Tafla, *Troubles and Travels of an Eritrean Aristocrat: A Presentation of Kāntiba Gilamika'el's Memoirs* (Aachen, 2007), 84-85.
- 26 B. Sòrgoni, *Etnografia e colonialismo: l'Eritrea e l'Etiopia di Alberto Pollera (1873-1939)* (Turin, 2001), 126-129.
- 27 A. Mockler, *Haile Selassie's War* (Oxford, 2003).
- 28 [http://www.nai.uu.se/library/resources/dossiers/local\\_history\\_of\\_ethiopia/](http://www.nai.uu.se/library/resources/dossiers/local_history_of_ethiopia/) (15 September 2015).
- 29 Q. Bosca, *Cronistoria della campagna italo-etiope dal 2 ottobre 1935 al 18 maggio 1936* (Rome, 1937), 23.
- 30 K. von Henneberg, 'Monuments, Public Space, and the Memory of Empire in Modern Italy', *History and Memory* 16 (2004): 37-85.
- 31 A. Triulzi, 'Adwa: from monument to document', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan, (Bern, 2005), 143-163.
- 32 V. Caruso and I. Domenico, *Il monumento alla batteria Masotto e alle batterie siciliane, Adua 1 marzo 1896* (Messina, 2014).
- 33 N. Labanca, 'History and Memory of Italian Colonialism Today', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall & D. Duncan, (Bern, 2005), 29-46.
- 34 M. Mondini, *Alpini: parole e immagini di un mito guerriero* (Rome, 2008).
- 35 N. Labanca, 'History and Memory of Italian Colonialism Today', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan (Bern, 2005), 29-46.
- 36 A. Triulzi, 'Adwa: from monument to document', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan (Bern, 2005), 143-163.
- 37 M.P. Guermandi, 'Italian archaeology in Africa: the arduous liberation of a discipline from colonial ideology', in *European Archaeology Abroad. Global Settings, Comparative Perspectives*, eds. S. van der Linde et al. (Leiden, 2012), 307-328.
- 38 K. von Henneberg, 'Monuments, Public Space, and the Memory of Empire in Modern Italy', *History and Memory* 16 (2004): 37-85, 49.
- 39 R. Steininger, *South Tyrol. A Minority Conflict of the Twentieth Century* (New Brunswick, 2003), 38-39.
- 40 <http://www.afronine.com/diari-di-viaggi-evento/102-alpini-in-eritrea-viaggio-della-memoria.html> (15 September 2015).
- A. Triulzi, 'Adwa: from monument to document', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan (Bern, 2005), 143-163.
- 41 Ibid.
- 42 N. Labanca, 'History and Memory of Italian Colonialism Today', in *Italian Colonialism. Legacy and Memory*, eds. J. Andall and D. Duncan (Bern, 2005), 29-46.
- 43 K. von Henneberg, 'Monuments, Public Space, and the Memory of Empire in Modern Italy', *History and Memory* 16 (2004): 37-85, 76.



1 With thanks to Pieter Deschoolmeester (city archives Blankenberge), Claudia Vermaut (city archives Ostend), Marjan De Smet and Mathilde Vandaele.

2 See amongst others: R. Mantels, *Geleerd in de tropen. Leuven, Congo en de wetenschap, 1885-1960* (Louvain, 2007), and D. Verbeke, 'Gecontesteerd koloniaal erfgoed', online: <http://users.telenet.be/brecht/stage/index.html>. The story is told in the short film *Sikitiko* (2010) by P. de Vos.

3 M.G. Stanard, 'King Leopold's bust: a story of monuments, culture, and memory in colonial Europe', *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History* 12 (2011), online. He states that 'although monuments to Belgium's second monarch appear to us today as unambiguously imperial, their meaning is anything but straightforward', and that 'monuments to this major figure of European imperialism are not necessarily colonial at all'.

4 J. van Lennep, 'Statues and monuments of Brussels, pre-1914', in *The statues and monuments of Brussels*, ed. Patrick Derom (Antwerp / Brussels, 2000), 11-180, 140-142.

5 An overview can be found in L. Catherine, *Wandelen naar Kongo. Koloniaal erfgoed in Brussel en België* (Berchem, 2006). Catherine is deeply involved in the struggle against colonialism and its heritage, and with his book he explicitly wants to give ammunition to those who want to challenge 'the official colonial historiography'.

6 *La Belgique militaire. Organe de la Défense Nationale*, 18 September 1921: 'en chassant les Arabes, ils ont libéré l'Afrique tropicale.'

7 F. de Callatay, 'Le monument du Congo de Thomas Vinçotte', *Bulletin des Musées royaux d'Art et d'Histoire* 61 (1996): 197-224; J. van Lennep, 'Statues and Monuments of Brussels, pre-1914', in *The statues and monuments of Brussels*, ed. Patrick Derom (Antwerp-Brussels, 2000), 11-180, 140; M. Couttenier, *Congo tentoongesteld: een geschiedenis van de Belgische antropologie en het museum van Tervuren (1882-1925)* (Louvain, 2005), 315.

8 L. Catherine, *Wandelen naar Kongo. Kolo-*

*niaal erfgoed in Brussel en België* (Berchem, 2006), 73-74.

9 According to some Lippens and De Bruyne were lovers. Walter Pauli wrote: 'Vandaag weten we dat Lippens en De Bruyne wellicht twee homo's waren. Twee mannen die het beu waren om hier hun aard te moeten loochenen. Die in Kongo vrijer konden ademen, en ook vrijer konden vrijen. Twee minnaars die liever samen stierven dan de ander alleen achter te laten.' What this romantic image is based upon remains somewhat unclear, even though De Bruyne's biographer has indeed suggested that he was a homosexual. Anyway, this interpretation, supported by Lucas Catherine, has led to a manifestation against homophobic violence on the site (on May 17th, 2012). See (including the quote from Pauli): R. Belemans and R. Daenen, 'Moeten er nog helden zijn? Over het dynamische heldenparadigma', *Faro. Tijdschrift over Cultureel Erfgoed* 5 (2012): 5-15, 14.

10 Blankenberge, Stadsarchief: dossier monument De Bruyne en Lippens: correspondence.

11 *L'ex-sous-officier. Journal bi-mensuel. Organe officiel de la Fédération Royale des Ex-Sous-Officiers de l'Armée Belge*, 15-12-1894.

12 Blankenberge, Stadsarchief: dossier monument De Bruyne en Lippens: letter from the Ministry of Agriculture, Direction of Fine Arts, 18-12-1898: 'l'immensité du décor de la mer et du ciel loin de l'écraser ne peut que le faire valoir'.

13 *La Belgique militaire. Organe de la Défense Nationale*, 18-09-1921: 'un noble exemple des vertus et des services que l'armée belge n'a cessé de prodiguer à notre œuvre coloniale' (665).

14 E. Bilé, *Blankenberge, een rijk verleden, een schone toekomst* (Blankenberge, 1971), 163.

15 Blankenberge, City archives: file monument De Bruyne and Lippens: letter from the Ministry of Agriculture, Direction of Fine Arts, 18 October 1898: 'ce groupe ne répond pas à la pensée du comité exécutif qui entend glorifier l'acte de solidarité héroïque posé par De Bruyne et non la protection apportée aux nègres par l'œuvre du Congo'.

16 *La Belgique militaire. Organe de la Défense Nationale*, 18-09-1921.

17 *Bulletin communal de la ville d'Ostende*,

1913, 465: city council session 20-05-1913: 'sa protection quasi paternelle pour la chère ville d'Ostende'.

18 *Bulletin communal de la ville d'Ostende*, 1913, 564: city council session 17-06-1913: 'la grandiose réalisation de l'Oeuvre du Congo'; 'une source inépuisable de richesse'; 'Souverain pacifique dont le long règne n'a eu qu'un but: la Grandeur de la Patrie'

19 *Gemeentebblad der Stad Oostende*, 1929, 165: city council session 01-04-1927.

20 *Gemeentebblad der Stad Oostende*, 1929, 118: city council session 14-04-1929: 'in den winter blootgesteld zijn aan verzanding en beschadiging'.

21 *Gemeentebblad der Stad Oostende*, 1927, 165: city council session 01-04-1927: 'nuttiger werk kan gedaan worden met dit geld'.

22 *Gemeentebblad der Stad Oostende*, 1929, 165: city council session 15-03-1929: 'De werkende klas van Oostende heeft weinig te danken aan Leopold II.'

23 *L'Echo d'Ostende et du Littoral*, 20-03-1929: 'un incident qui permit au doux poète Daan Boens de fanfaronner pour la galerie en attaquant la mémoire de feu notre grand Roi Léopold II'.

24 *Gemeentebblad der Stad Oostende*, 1929, 165: city council session 15-03-1929.

25 *L'Echo d'Ostende et du Littoral*, 25-07-1931: 'immenses services qu'ils ont rendus au pays en répandant pendant la période dite héroïque de la Colonisation, à l'appel de l'Auguste fondateur de la Colonie'.

26 V. Viaene, 'Reprise-remise. De Congolese identiteitscrisis van België rond 1908', in *Congo in België. Koloniale cultuur in de metropool*, eds. Vincent Viaene, David van Reybrouck and Bambi Ceuppens (Louvain, 2009), 43-62.

27 T. Verschaffel, 'The wind blows hard, but the sky remains blue... The message of Expo 58', in *Expo 58: between utopia and reality*, ed. G. Pluvinage (Brussels, 2008), 73-93, 91-92; and S. van Beurden, 'Un panorama de nos valeurs africaines.' Belgisch Congo op Expo 58, in *Congo in België. Koloniale cultuur in de metropool*, ed. V. Viaene, D. van Reybrouck en B. Ceuppens (Louvain, 2009), 299-311.

28 J.L. Vellut et al., eds., *Het geheugen van Congo: de koloniale tijd* (Ghent, 2005). Voor de discussie, zie among others: M. Rey-

nebeau, "Het geheugen van Congo" in het Afrikamuseum. Een museum kijkt in eigen boezem', *De Standaard*, 04-02-2005; and M. Couttenier, 'Tervuren: het museum. Het spel van vergeten en herinneren', in *België, een parcours van herinnering: plaatsen van geschiedenis en expansie*, eds. J. Tollebeek e.a. (Amsterdam, 2008), 309-319, 309.

29 M. Couttenier, *Congo tentoongesteld: een geschiedenis van de Belgische antropologie en het museum van Tervuren (1882-1925)* (Louvain, 2005).

30 'Het museum was een anachronisme geworden', *Davidfonds Cultuurmagazine*, March 2015, 40-44.

---

The 'Great Ruin' in Leiden as a *Lieu de Mémoire* of Nationalism and Imperialism in 19th-Century Dutch Biology  
[p. 57]

---

1 P. Rietbergen, *Rome and the world – the world in Rome: the politics of international culture, 1861-2011* (Dordrecht, 2012). See also Rietbergen's manuscript on Berlin cultural politics.

2 Moreover, since one of the victims had been Adriaan Kluit (1735-1807), a professor in history and statistics who had written about the waning of Dutch power in the eighteenth century, Louis Napoleon created a permanent chair in statistics, tightening Leiden science to central state policy a bit more. H. Boschloo, *De productiemaatschappij: liberalisme, economische wetenschap en het vraagstuk der armoede in Nederland, 1800-1875* (Hilversum, 1989), 18; D. van Delft, *Freezing physics: Heike Kamerlingh Onnes and the quest for cold* (Amsterdam, 2007), 261-286.

3 W. Otterspeer, *Groepsportret met dame 1. Het bolwerk van de vrijheid. De Leidse universiteit, 1575-1672* (Amsterdam, 2000), 63.

4 At this laboratory, decades later, the physicist Heike Kamerlingh Onnes (1853-1926) would work with explosive gases again to the chagrin and worries of the city council. van Delft, *Freezing physics: Heike Kamerlingh Onnes and the quest for cold*, 261-286.

5 *Handelingen van de Tweede Kamer der Staten-Generaal* (Proceedings of the Second Chamber of the Estates-General, *HTK*) 1872-



- 1873, *Bijlagen* (addenda), no. 149, sub no. 3.
- 6 A. Kölliker, 'Skizze einer wissenschaftlichen Reise nach Holland und England in Briefen an C. Th. v. Siebold', *Zeitschrift für wissenschaftliche Zoologie* 3 (1851), 81-106.
- 7 Among many others, K. van Berkel, *In het voetspoor van Stevin. Geschiedenis van de natuurwetenschap in Nederland, 1580-1940* (Meppel/Amsterdam, 1985), 169. See also my first chapter of my dissertation: R.-J. Wille, 'De stationisten. Laboratoriumbiologie, imperialisme en de lobby voor nationale wetenschapspolitiek, 1871-1909' (Ph.D. diss., Radboud University, 2015).
- 8 M. Hoijsink, *Caspar J.C. Reuvens en de musea van oudheden in Europa (1800-1840)* (Ph.D. diss., University of Amsterdam, 2009), 96-124.
- 9 L. Roberts, 'Centres and cycles of accumulation', in *Centres of accumulation in and around the Netherlands during the Early Modern Period*, ed. Lissa Roberts, (Berlin, 2011), 3-28.
- 10 G.E. Allen, *Life science in the twentieth century* (New York, 1975); J.V. Pickstone, *Ways of knowing: a new history of science, technology, and medicine* (Chicago, 2001); R.E. Kohler, *Landscapes and labs: exploring the lab-field border in biology* (Chicago, 2002).
- 11 R. De Bont, 'Between the laboratory and the deep blue sea: space issues in the marine stations of Naples and Wimereux', *Social Studies of Science* 39 (2009): 199-227.
- 12 Van Berkel, *In het voetspoor van Stevin*, 139 ff.
- 13 *HTK* 1872-1873, *Bijlagen*, no. 2, chapter v, sub nos. 106, 13.
- 14 *Ibid.*
- 15 *HTK* 1872-1873, page 588.
- 16 K. van Berkel, *De stem van de wetenschap 1. Geschiedenis van de Koninklijke Nederlandse Akademie van Wetenschappen, 1808-1914* (Amsterdam, 2008), 415-419.
- 17 Chapter 2 in Wille, 'De stationisten'.
- 18 R.-J. Wille, 'De nationale waarde van ontwikkeling. De patricische embryoloog Ambrosius Hubrecht en de noodzaak van de liberale staat om te investeren in onderwijs en wetenschap', *De Negentiende Eeuw* 33 (2009): 34-52.
- 19 Chapter 3 in Wille, 'De stationisten'.
- 20 Undated report from Snellen van Vollenhoven addressed to Hendrik Vollenhoven (1816-1889), the civil servant working for the division of education, arts and sciences, National Archives The Hague (NA), Paul Hubrecht papers, inv.no. 1.
- See also L.B. Holthuis, *1820-1958: Rijksmuseum van Natuurlijke Historie* (Leiden, 1995).
- 21 See: [https://www.erfgoedleiden.nl/component/lei\\_verhalen/verhaal/id/349](https://www.erfgoedleiden.nl/component/lei_verhalen/verhaal/id/349) (accessed 02-04-2015), which refers to many interesting journal articles addressing the issue.
- 22 J. Perry, *Ons fatsoen als natie: Victor de Stuers, 1843-1916* (Amsterdam, 2004); E. Tanja, 'Spanning tussen kader en karakter. Victor de Stuers (1843-1916) als Tweede-Kamerlid', (MA-thesis, Rijksuniversiteit Groningen, 2004); V. de Stuers, 'Holland op zijn smalst', *De Gids* 37 (1873): 320-403. On cultural nationalism in the arts much has been written, on cultural nationalism in the sciences, see: R.P.W. Visser, 'Het "Nederlandsch Natuur- en Geneeskundig Congres" over de relatie natuurwetenschap en samenleving, 1887-1900', in *Balans en perspectief van de Nederlandse cultuurgeschiedenis. De productie, distributie en consumptie van cultuur*, eds. J. Kloek and W. Mijnhardt (Amsterdam/Atlanta, 1991), 37-48; K. van Berkel, *Citaten uit het boek der natuur: opstellen over Nederlandse wetenschapsgeschiedenis* (Amsterdam, 1998), 221-239; F.H. van Lunteren, 'Wetenschap over het vaderland. J.D. van der Waals en de Afdeling Natuurkunde', in *De Akademie en de Tweede Gouden Eeuw*, ed. Klaas van Berkel (Amsterdam, 2004), 43-106.
- 23 Verheyen en Cuypers zullen niet anders in 't midden durven brengen dan wat jij hun vertelt'; Hubrecht to parents, 14 August 1877, Regional Archive Leiden (RAL), Hubrecht family archive with additions (Hubr. A.), 902.
- 24 'Vergelijking van de bebouwde oppervlakten van eenige Musea van N.H.' and 'Declaratie', Map of correspondence and notes, Bureau Cuypers (CUBA), Het Nieuwe Instituut Rotterdam, (HNI), inv.no. g 113.
- 25 J.B.A.J.M. Verheijen, P.J.H. Cuypers and A.A.W. Hubrecht, *Rapport over de inrigting van eenige voorname musea van natuurlijke historie in het buitenland: naar aanleiding van de voorgenomen stichting van een nieuw gebouw voor 's Rijks Museum te Leiden* (Leiden, 1878), 79-81.
- 26 However, by formulating it carefully

opponents could be convinced that the museum could potentially gather evidence against evolution too. Hubrecht wrote that there were two things that separated him from Schlegel: evolution and the way museums should be organized. A.A.W. Hubrecht, 'Hermann Schlegel', *De Gids* 48 (1884): 536-547, alhier 536.

27 Verheijen, Cuypers en Hubrecht, *Rapport*, 89.

28 Schlegel's position deteriorated at the Department. Many civil servants complained about his 'childish' and non-constructive behavior. Copy letter Schlegel, 8th of February 1879 and anonymous report of civil servant to Hubrecht sr. in RAL, Hubr. A., inv.no. 1327.

29 Verheijen, Cuypers en Hubrecht, *Rapport*. Transcript of letter Schlegel, 23 May 1878, to minister of Interior Affairs, RAL, Hubr. A, inv. no. 1327. See also R. Langenbeek, *Les musées d'histoire naturelle de Leyde, Paris et Londres. Analyse de l'évolution et du mode d'exposition des objets de musées d'histoire naturelle jusqu'aux premières années du XIXe siècle; comparaison entre le 's Rijks Museum van Natuurlijke Historie'* (Ph.D. diss. Ecole Doctorale Sciences de la Nature et de l'Homme, 2010), 184.

30 See also his ideas in F.A. Jentink, 'Das ideal eines naturhistorischen Museum', in *Sixième congrès international de zoologie. Compte rendu des séances*, ed. M. Bedot (Berne, 1905), 523-529.

31 See also this site: <http://tientjevoortrex.naturalis.nl/nl/> (accessed 02-04-2015).

## II Religious *Lieux de Mémoire*

---

Some Thoughts on Toleration as an Early-Modern North-Atlantic Virtue [p. 68]

---

1 J. Jacobs, *The Colony of New Netherland: A Dutch Settlement in Seventeenth-Century America* (Ithaca/London, 2009); revised ed. of *New Netherland: A Dutch Colony in Seventeenth-Century America* (Leiden/Boston, 2005); H. Krabbendam, C.A. van Minnen and G. Scott-Smith, eds., *Four Centuries of Dutch-*

*American Relations, 1609-2009* (Amsterdam, 2009).

2 J. Locke, *Epistola de tolerantia* (1689), trans. by W. Popple, *A Letter concerning Toleration* (1689); Latin and English texts revised and edited by M. Montuori (The Hague, 1963); P. Bayle, *A Philosophical Commentary on these Words of the Gospel, Luke 14:23, 'Compel Them to Come In, That My House May Be Full'* (1686), ed. J. Kilcullen and C. Kukathas (Indianapolis, 2005); Voltaire, *Traité sur la tolérance*, introduction and notes by J. Renwick (Oxford, 1999). Cf. J. Marshall, *John Locke, Toleration and early Enlightenment Culture* (Cambridge, 2006); J. Kilcullen, *Sincerity and Truth. Essays on Arnauld, Bayle, and Toleration* (Oxford, 1988); J.I. Israel, *Radical Enlightenment. Philosophy and the Making of Modernity, 1650-1750* (Oxford, 2001); idem, 'The Intellectual Debate about Toleration in the Dutch Republic', in *The Emergence of Tolerance in the Dutch Republic*, ed. C. Berkvens-Stevelinck, J. Israel and G.H.M. Posthumus Meyjes (Leiden/New York/Cologne, 1997), 3-36; J.I. Israel, 'Locke, Spinoza and the Philosophical Debate Concerning Toleration in the Early Enlightenment (c. 1670 – c. 1750)', in *Koninklijke Nederlandse Akademie van Wetenschappen, Mededelingen van de Afdeling Letterkunde* (Amsterdam), new series, vol. 62, no. 6 (1999), 5-19.

3 R. Balmer, *A Perfect Babel of Confusion: Dutch Religion and English Culture in the Middle Colonies* (New York/Oxford, 1989) has sharply set the tone for such approaches.

4 On toleration in New Netherland: J. Jacobs, 'Between Repression and Approval: Connivance and Tolerance in the Dutch Republic and in New Netherland', *De Halve Maen. Magazine of the Dutch Colonial Period in America*, 71-3 (1998): 51-58; E. Haefeli, *New Netherland and the Dutch Origins of American Religious Liberty* (Philadelphia, 2012); W. Frijhoff, 'Religion and Toleration in Old and New Netherland', in *The Worlds of the Seventeenth-Century Hudson Valley*, ed. Jaap Jacobs and L.H. Roper (Albany, 2014), 197-224.

5 *Texts concerning the Revolt of the Netherlands*, ed. E.H. Kossman and A.F. Mellink (Cambridge UK, 1974), 165-173. Further: A.Th. van Deursen, 'Between unity and independence: the application of the Union

as a fundamental law', in *The Low Countries History Yearbook* 14 (1981): 50-65.

6 A. Duke, *Reformation and Revolt in the Low Countries* (London, 1990); Martin van Gelderen, *The Political Thought of the Dutch Revolt 1555-1590* (Cambridge, 1992), 213-259.

7 L. Heywood and J. Thornton, *Central Africans, Atlantic Creoles, and the Foundation of the Americas, 1585-1660* (New York/London, 2007).

8 Original text: 'Sullen binnen haer bedryff anders geen Gods dienst pleegen als die vande gereformeerde religie in manieren tegenwoordich hier te lande gepleecht wort, ende soo door hun Cristelyck leven ende wandel de Indianen ende andere blinde menschen tot de kennisz Godes ende synes woort sien te trecken, sonder nochtans ijemant ter oorsaecke van syne religie te vervolgen, maer een yder de vrijh[eyt] van sijn consciencie te laten', in F.C. Wieder, *De stichting van New York in juli 1625. Reconstructies en nieuwe gegevens ontleend aan de Van Rappard documenten* (The Hague, 1925; reprint Zutphen, 2009), 112.

9 For the Dutch background: J. van Eijnatten, *Liberty and Concord in the United Provinces: Religious Toleration and the Public in the Eighteenth-Century Netherlands* (Leiden/Boston, 2003).

10 W. Frijhoff, 'Religious toleration in the United Provinces: from "case" to "model"', in *Calvinism and Religious Toleration in the Dutch Golden Age*, ed. R. Po-Chia-Hsia and H. van Nierop (Cambridge, 2002), 27-52; idem, 'Dutchness in fact and fiction', in *Going Dutch: The Dutch Presence in America, 1609-2009*, ed. J.D. Goodfriend, B. Schmidt and A. Stott (Leiden/Boston, 2008), 327-358; W. Frijhoff and M. Spies, *1650: Hard-Won Unity*, Dutch Culture in a European perspective, trans. Myra Heerspink-Scholz (Assen/Basingstoke, 2004); A. Pettegree, 'The politics of toleration in the free Netherlands, 1572-1620', in *Tolerance and intolerance in the European Reformation*, ed. O.P. Grell and B. Scribner (Cambridge UK, 1996), 182-198; Joke Spaans, 'Violent dreams, peaceful coexistence: On the absence of religious violence in the Dutch Republic', *De Zeventiende Eeuw*, 18 (2002): 149-166; Benjamin J. Kaplan, *Divided by Faith: Religious Conflict and the*

*Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge, MA/London, 2007); C. Scott Dixon, D. Freist and M. Greengrass, eds., *Living with religious diversity in early modern Europe* (Farnham, 2009).

11 D. Volckerts Coornhert, *Synod on the Freedom of Conscience: A Thorough Examination during the Gathering Held in the Year 1582 in the City of Freetown*, trans. G. Voogt (Amsterdam, 2008).

12 W. Temple, *Observations upon the United Provinces of the Netherlands*, ed. G. Clark (Oxford, 1972), 103.

13 R. Shorto, *The Island at the Center of the World. The Epic Story of Dutch Manhattan and the Forgotten Colony That Shaped America* (New York, 2004). See also the website of the Dutch-American entrepreneur Joep de Koning: [www.tolerancewalk.com](http://www.tolerancewalk.com).

14 Shorto, *The Island at the Center of the World*, 96-97.

---

Grailville's Sacred Agriculture.  
Representations of a Dutch Female Heritage  
in Ohio, US  
[p. 77]

---

1 J. Pearce, *Literary Converts. Spiritual Inspiration in an Age of Unbelief* (London 1999) 146-165; M.F. Coady, 'Evelyn Waugh in America', *Catholic Life* (October 2012). <http://maryfrancescoady.com/recent-articles/evelyn-waugh-in-america/>.

2 E. Waugh, 'The American Epoch in the Catholic Church', *Life Magazine* (19-09-1949).

3 Letter to the editor, in: *Life Magazine* (10-10-1949), 4.

4 Quoted in J. Kalven, *Women Breaking Boundaries: A Grail Journey, 1940-1995* (Albany, 1999) 314.

5 Ibid.

6 *De Graal en haar apostolische activiteiten in de missielanden* (Ubbergen, 1958). L. van Kersbergen, *Grailville community college. A modern development in the education of young women* (Loveland, 1954).

7 T.E. Page, 'The problem of the land is the problem of the woman': A genealogy of eco-feminism at Grailville (Harvard, 2008); J.B. Kuchuba, 'In search of the 21st century Grail', *Cincinnati Magazine* (August 2000): 56-63;

123-125; <http://www.womenofgrace.com/blog/?p=30080>.

8 <http://www.grail-us.org/who-we-are/history-of-the-grail-in-the-us/>.

9 J. Kalven, *Women Breaking Boundaries: A Grail Journey, 1940-1995* (Albany, 1999), 43-44.

10 *Arch. Grail movement*, no. 360: M. Meertens, nr. 360: 'Levensgeschiedenis van pater Jac. van Ginneken sj' (typescript, 1964).

11 *Arch. Grail movement*, no. 1: Jac. van Ginneken, 'Mij kwelt en prangt...', in: *Van onzen tijd* (1919); 'Die Konversionsbewegung in Holland', *Stimmen der Zeit* 106:1-2 (1923-1924), 1-19.

12 M. Derks, *Heilig moeten. Radicaal-katholiek en retro-modern in de jaren twintig en dertig* (Hilversum, 2007).

13 P. Luykx, 'Daar is nog, poëzie, nog kleur, nog warmte'. *Katholieke bekeerlingen en moderniteit in Nederland, 1880-1960* (Hilversum, 2007); P. Allitt, *Catholic converts. British and American intellectuals turn to Rome* (Ithaca / London, 1997).

14 P.M. Kane, "'She offered herself up'. The Victim Soul and Victim Spirituality in Catholicism', *Church History* 71:1 (2002): 80-119; also: B. Moore, *Sacred Dread: Raïssa Maritain, the Allure of Suffering, and the French Catholic Revival, 1905-1945* (Notre Dame, 2012); R. Burton, *Holy Tears, Holy Blood. Women, Catholicism and the Culture of Suffering in France, 1840-1970* (London, 2004).

15 E. Goffman, *Asylums. Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and other Inmates* (New York, 1961); Derks, *Heilig moeten*, 290-294.

16 In 1954, a brochure on the community college by Van Kersbergen was titled *A modern development in the education of young women*.

17 Kalven, *Women Breaking Boundaries*, 55-58.

18 A.V. Brown, 'The Grail Movement to 1962: Laywomen and a New Christendom', *U.S. Catholic Historian* 3:3 (1983): 149-166.

19 L. van Kersbergen, 'De Graal: een katholieke jonge-vrouwenbeweging', *Het Binnenhof* (14-05-1991).

20 S. McFarland Taylor, *Green Sisters: A Spiritual Ecology* (Harvard, 2007) 38.

21 L. Cornwell, 'Women's spiritual center embraces future, remains faithful to past',

*The Associated Press State & Local Wire* (22-01-2000).

22 E. Murphy, E. Robinson, *The Grail at Grailville, the early years* (2009) <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xpwuPBtc6cw>.

23 <https://www.grailville.org/> (June 10, 2015).

24 *De Graal en haar apostolische activiteiten in de missielanden* (Ubbergen, 1958).

25 W. van de Ven, 'Heer laat uit mij groeien waartoe Gij mij gemaakt hebt'. Kennismaking met de Graal', *KNR-Bulletin* 12:5 (2009) 12-13.

26 I. van Emmerik, ed., *Gevaarlijk modern. Levende geschiedenissen van vrouwen in de Graalbeweging* (typescript, 2001).

27 'Parel van de Graal in de verkoop', *Trouw* (24-01-2003).

28 Cf. the essay of Willem Frijhoff in this volume.

---

'If I forget thee, O Jerusalem' (Ps. 137:5)  
Evocations of its Past and Hopes for its Future  
[p. 86]

---

1 Th. Friedman, *From Beirut to Jerusalem* (New York, 1990), 429.

2 B. Kühnel, *From the Earthly to the Heavenly Jerusalem. Representations of the Holy City in Christian Art of the First Millennium* (Rome / Freiburg, 1987), 74.

3 B.E. Daley, *The Hope of the Early Church. A Handbook of Patristic Eschatology* (Cambridge, 1991), 21-22.

4 R.L. Wilken, *The Land Called Holy. Palestine in Christian History and Thought* (New Haven, 1992), 61.

5 Victorinus of Pettau, Opera, in *Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum Latinorum* 49, ed. J. Haussleiter (Vienna / Leipzig, 1916) 148.

6 Origen, *In Canticum Cantorum*, 11 .6, in *Patres Graeci*, ed. Migne, 13.115, also *De Principiis Libri IV*, 1v.3.7, eds. H. Görgemanns and H. Kapp (Darmstadt, 1976), 752-53.

7 Augustine, *De Civitate Dei*, xx.17, *La cité de Dieu*, ed. G. Bardy and trans. G. Combès, 5 vols. (Tournai, 1959-1960), v.270, 272: '[Haec verba] sunt de saeculo futuro et de immortalitate atque aeternitate sanctorum.'

8 Hilary of Poitiers, *Tractatus in CXXXIV psalmum*, in *Patres Latini*, ed. Migne, 9.681-682.

9 D. Obolensky, 'Byzantium and Russia', in

- Europe in the Later Middle Ages, eds. John Hale et al., (London, 1965), 265-66.
- 10 H. Donner, *Pilgerfahrt ins Heilige Land. Die ältesten Berichte christlicher Palästina-pilger (4.-7. Jahrhundert)* (Stuttgart, 1979), 59.
- 11 J. Murphy O' Connor, *The Holy Land. An Archaeological Guide from Earliest Times to 1700* (Oxford 1986<sup>2</sup>), 105.
- 12 Jerome, *Praefatio in librum Paralipomenon*, in *Patres Latini*, ed. Migne, 29. 401.
- 13 E.D. Hunt, *Holy Land Pilgrimage in the Later Roman Empire AD 312-460* (Oxford, 1984), 92.
- 14 Gregory of Nyssa, *Epistolae*, 11, in *Patres Graeci*, ed. Migne, 46.1010-1011. For both Jerome and Gregory see also S. Schein, *Gateway to the Heavenly City. Crusader Jerusalem and the Catholic West (1099-1187)* (Aldershot, 2005), 111.
- 15 Op. cit., 83.
- 16 *Vita S. Udalrici prioris Cellensis (prior)*, in *MGH Scriptores* 12, ed. R. Wilmans (Hannover, 1856), 251-253, 252.
- 17 Schein, *Gateway*, 109 calls this new phenomenon 'horizontal agony'.
- 18 B. McGinn, *Visions of the End. Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages* (New York, 1979), 86.
- 19 Wilkinson, *Jerusalem Pilgrims*, Jehoshafat mentioned: 53, 66, 83, 99, 131, 137, 147, as location of the Last Judgment: 61, 120 and 144.
- 20 C. Morris, *The Sepulchre of Christ and the Medieval West. From the Beginning to 1600* (Oxford, 2005), 139-146.
- 21 William of Jumièges, *Historiae Northmannorum (Gesta ducum Normannorum)*, vi.13, in *Patres Latini*, ed. Migne, 149. 846. Another version in William of Malmesbury, *De gestis regum Anglorum*, Rolls-series, ed. W. Stubbs, vol. 1-2 (London, 1887-89), i.211-12.
- 22 M. Chibnall, ed., *The Ecclesiastical History of Orderic Vitalis*, Oxford Medieval texts, 6 vols. (Oxford, 1969-1980), ii. 71-73.
- 23 P.C. Boeren, ed., *Rorgo Fretellus de Nazareth et sa description de la Terre Sainte. Histoire et édition du texte*, Koninklijke Nederlandse Akademie van Wetenschappen, afd. letterkunde, Verhandelingen, nieuwe reeks, 105 (Amsterdam, 1980) 6
- 24 Bernard of Clairvaux, *Epistolae*, cccxciii, eds. J. Leclercq and H. Rochais, *S. Bernardi Opera*, 8 (Rome, 1977) 365.
- 25 N. Housley, *The Later Crusades, 1274-1580* (Oxford, 1992) 7-117.
- 26 F. Faber, *Evagatorium in Terrae Sanctae, Arabiae et Aegypti peregrinationem*, ed. C.D. Hassler, vol. 1-3 (Stuttgart, 1843-1849) about the authenticity of the tomb: i. 330-337 about the experiment: 'Accepi candellam accensam...': i. 335. See also Morris, *Sepulchre of Christ*, 322-3.
- 27 A classic example is G. A. Smith, *The Historical Geography of the Holy Land* (London, 1894), reprinted up till now.

---

'Convivencia' between Mediterranean Parochialism and Universalism [p. 94]

---

- 1 A. Akasoy, 'Convivencia and its discontents: Interfaith life in Al-Andalus', *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 42 (2010): 489-499.
- 2 H. Driessen, 'Mediterranean Port Cities: Cosmopolitanism Reconsidered', *History and Anthropology* 16 (2005): 129-141.
- 3 P. Balinger, *History in Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans* (Princeton, NJ, 2003).
- 4 Driessen, 'Mediterranean Port Cities', 129-141.
- 5 D. Duru, 'From Mosaic to Ebru: Conviviality in Multi-Ethnic, Multi-Faith Burgazadasi, Istanbul', *South European Society and Politics*, 20 (2015): 243-263; F., Ziad, 'Jurisdictional Borderlands: Extra-territoriality and "Legal Chameleons" in Pre-colonial Alexandria', *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 55 (2013): 305-329; U. Freitag, "'Cosmopolitanism" and "Conviviality?": Some Conceptual Considerations Concerning the Late Ottoman Empire', *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 17 (2014): 375-391; M. Jackson, "'Cosmopolitan" Smyrna: Illuminating or Obscuring Cultural Histories?', *Geographical Review* 102 (2012): 337-349; T. Unlu, 'Transformation of a Mediterranean Port City into a "City of Clutter": Dualities in the Urban Landscape – The Case of Mersin', *Cities* 30 (2013): 175-185.
- 6 For Kuzguncuk see: A. Mills, *Streets of Memory. Landscape, Tolerance and National Identity in Istanbul* (Athens, GA, 2010).



For Tophane see: K. Schuitema, 'Your Memories, My Memories? A Biography of the Tophane Neighbourhood: Conflicting Views on Heritage and Identity', (Ph.D. proposal, 2014).  
 7 H. Driessen, *Tussen oude continenten. De vele gezichten van de Middellandse Zee* (Amsterdam, 2008).  
 8 H. Driessen, *On the Spanish-Moroccan Frontier. A Study in Ritual, Power and Ethnicity* (Oxford, 1992).  
 9 B. Campbell, 'Multiculturalism, Law and Informal Personal Relations in Ceuta' (Ph.D. diss., University of Kent, 2013).  
 10 D. Lowenthal, 'Mediterranean heritage: ancient marvel, modern millstone', *Nations and Nationalism* 14 (2008): 369-392.  
 11 B. Peveling, 'Reserves and Mediterranean Niches in Marseille', *Anthropos* 106 (2011): 207-211.

---

The Schmutzer-Iko Sculptures.  
 An Experiment in Adaptation  
 [p. 99]

---

1 This article is mainly based on two sources: the Archives of the Schmutzer Family (ASF) in the Catholic Documentation Centre, Nijmegen, and the Euwals Collection in the Mission Museum, Steyl, collected by the curator Jan Euwals on the occasion of the acquiring of the sculptures by the Museum. I am grateful to both institutions for their assistance, especially to Mr. Euwals for his help so readily given. There is a lot of literature on the subject of adaptation. With regard to The Netherlands East Indies/Indonesia see especially: H. Boelaars, *Indonesianisasi. Het omvormingsproces van de Katholieke Kerk in Indonesië tot de Indonesische Katholieke Kerk* (Kampen, 1991), with a summary in English, 401-413, and J. van Vugt et al. eds., *Tempo doeloe, tempo sekarang. Het proces van indonesianisering in Nederlandse orden en congregaties*, Metamorfofen. Studies in religieuze geschiedenis, vol. 6 (Hilversum, 2004). In two books Karel Steenbrink gave some attention to Schmutzer and the sculptures, in: K. Steenbrink, with the cooperation of P. Maas, *Catholics in Indonesia, 1808-1942. A documented history. Vol. 2 The spectacular growth of a self-confident minority, 1903-1942*, (Leiden, 2007), 395-397, and in: J. Sihar

Aritonang and K. Steenbrink, eds., *A History of Christianity in Indonesia* (Leiden, 2008), 927-930.  
 2 V. Poels et al., eds., *Life with a Mission. Cardinal Willem Marinus van Rossum C.Ss.R. (1854-1932)*, special issue of: *Trajecta. Religie, cultuur en samenleving in de Nederlanden 19-20* (2010-2011), 1-2, particularly the articles by C. Prudhomme and H. de Valk.  
 3 A. Camps, 'Celso Costantini. Apostolic Delegate in China (1922-1933). The Changing Role of the Foreign Missionary', in *Studies in Asian Mission History 1956-1998*, ed. A. Camps, (Leiden, 2000), 169-174. C. Costantini, *Manuel d'art pour les missionnaires* (Paris, 1949), French translation from the Italian 1940, 293-309 on the Schmutzer-Iko sculptures.  
 4 *Autour du problème de l'Adaptation. Compte rendu de la quatrième semaine de missiologie de Louvain* (1926) (Louvain, 1926). J. ten Berge's lecture, 'La nécessité d'un art chrétien indigène en pays de mission', 213-231.  
 5 L.J. Rogier, *Katholieke herleving. Geschiedenis van Katholiek Nederland sinds 1853* (The Hague, 1956), 'De kwarteeuw der ontluiking', 349-539.  
 6 V.J. Koningsberger, *In memoriam Prof.Dr.Ir. Josef Ignaz Julius Marie Schmutzer [...] Rede uitgesproken voor den Senaat van de Rijks-universiteit te Utrecht op 28 September 1946* (Utrecht, 1946), 3.  
 7 On Schmutzer, in addition to Koningsberger (note 6), see also: J. Roes, 'Het Sint Melania-werk. Leerschool voor ontwikkelingshulp en missie', *Jaarboek Katholiek Documentatie Centrum* 1971, 111-137, J. Bank, *Katholieken en de Indonesische Revolutie* (Baarn, 1983), M.J.G. Huetink, 'Het Katholiek Comité voor Vluchtelingen 1936-1940 [...]' (MA-thesis Radboud University, 1988), and P. Luykx, 'Katholieken en het Comité van Waakzaamheid', in *Andere katholieken. Opstellen over Nederlandse katholieken in de twintigste eeuw*, ed. Paul Luyx (Nijmegen, 2000), 117-132. Schmutzer was great friends with Gerard Brom, see: G. Brom, *Een katholieke leven. Autobiografische aantekeningen*, eds. P. Luykx and J. Roes (Baarn, 1987) and P. Luykx, *Heraut van de katholieke herleving: Gerard Brom (1882-1959)* (Nijmegen, 2015).  
 8 N.J. Krom, *Inleiding tot de Hindoe-Javaansche kunst* (The Hague, 1920).



9 On this 'christian-japanese renaissance' and on adaptation Schmutzer wrote e.g. in 'Christelijk-Javaansche kunst', in *Europeanisme of Katholicisme*, ed. J. Schmutzer et al. (Utrecht, 1927), 57-92.

10 H. van Meurs, 'Iko, de Soendasche beeldsnijder', *Cultureel Indië*, vol. 3 (Leiden, 1941), 101-106.

11 J. Schmutzer to Mgr. A. van Velsen, 05-09-1925, copy, in: Collection Euwals, Mission Museum Steyl.

12 See note 9. The French edition: J.J. Schmutzer and J. ten Berge s.j., *Européanisme et Catholicisme* (Paris/Louvain, 1929).

13 Prawirapratama, 'Christelijk-Javaansche kunst. Het werk van Dr. Schmutzer', *De Maasbode*, 20/21-10-1927. J.R., title unknown, *De Koerier*, date unknown. J.R.'s article is part of a typescript in ASF inv.no 32. J.R.'s article was commented upon by the editors of *De Koerier*, see the same typescript. J. ten Berge s.j. wrote a comment on Prawirapratama's articles, see ASF inv.no 32, which however was not published by *De Maasbode*.

14 Joh. Hellings s.j., 'Katholieke Javaansche kunst', *Het Gildeboek* 21:2 (1938): 42-51, 49.

15 J.B. Aufhauser, 'Eingeborene Christliche Kunst in nichtchristlichen Ländern', *Die Christliche Kunst* 31 (1934-1935), 97-109, 97.

16 J.W., 'Voorwoord', *Het Gildeboek* 21:2 (1938): 41-42, 42.

17 B.A.G. Vroklage s.v.d., 'Inlandsche Kunst en Christendom in N.-O. Indië', *De Katholieke Missiën* 62 (1936-1937): 1-6, 27-33 and 47-55, 53. Sepp Schüller, 'Christliche Kunst in Java', and 'Die Christlich-Javanische Bildhauerei', *Het Gildeboek* 21:2 (1938): 51-52 and 52-55. J.B. Aufhauser, 'Christliche einheimische Kunst in nichtchristlichen Ländern', *Die Christliche Kunst* 25:6 (1929): 161-174, and the article see note 15.

18 Silenter, 'Europeanisme of Katholicisme?', *Sociaal Leven en Streven. Orgaan van den Centralen Raad der Nederlandsch-Indische Katholieke Sociale Bonden* 9 (11/18/25-04-1928), 117-119, 124-126 and 133-134. Hellings, o.c. (note 14), 49. Van Meurs, o.c. (note 10), 106.

19 J. Schmutzer, 'Het apostolaat der kunst' and 'Javaansche madonna's', *Sint Claverbond* 47:3 (1935): 53-68, and no 10, 214-222. See also a typescript 'Christelijke kunst op Java', ASF inv.no 32.

19 J. Schmutzer, 'Culture et art chrétien', *Univers. Bulletin Catholique International* (1938): 46-47, 47, and 64-65. About the same text with the same title in *SAM Societas Auxiliarium Missionum* 12:39 (1938): 8-11.

### III Contact Zones

---

'White People, or Might be Devils'. Commemoration of the 1705 Dutch Landing at Piramparnalli, Melville Island, North Australia [p. 126]

---

- 1 P. Nora, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Memoire', *Representations* 27(1989): 7-24, 13.
- 2 D.B. Rose, 'The Saga of Captain Cook: Remembrance and Morality', in *Telling Stories: Indigenous History and Memory in Australia and New Zealand*, ed. B. Attwood and F. Magowan (Sydney, 2001), 61-79; Ch. Healy, 'In the Beginning was Captain Cook', *Australian Humanities Review* 5(1997).
- 3 H. Zwaerdecroon and C. Chastelij, 'Verslag eener reis naar de Noordkust van Nieuw Holland in 1705', *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van Nederlandsch Indië*, N.S. 1(1856): 193-202.
- 4 M. Wonaeamirri, *The Tiwi Meet the Dutch: The First European Contacts* (Darwin, 1995), 3.
- 5 J.C. Goodale, 'The Tiwi of Melville and Bathurst Islands, northern Australia', in *Cambridge Encyclopedia of Hunters and Gatherers*, ed. R.B. Lee and R. Daly (Cambridge, 1999), 353-557, 553.
- 6 Tiwi Land Council, *Sixteenth Annual Report 1994/95* (Darwin, 1995), 10.
- 7 H. Sondaal, personal communication.
- 8 J.E. Heeres, *Het aandeel der Nederlanders in de ontdekking van Australië 1606-1765* [The Part Borne by the Dutch in the Discovery of Australia 1606-1765 (Leiden/London, 1899), 19].
- 9 'Landing Commemoration', *Tiwi News* 11, February 11, 2005, p. 10.
- 10 'Tiwi and the Dutch', directed by M. Wilson, ABC TV (Yarning Up series 3), broad-

- casted on 15 January 2012, see <https://vimeo.com/79368170> or <https://teabba.com.au/yarning-up-series-3-tiwi-and-the-dutch/>.
- 11 'Tiwi and the Dutch', produced by the Top End Aboriginal Bush Broadcasting Association (TEABBA), won the Galah Award for the best documentary at a 2013 Darwin film festival, see <https://fistfuloffilms.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/12.-Best-Documentary-Tiwi-and-the-Dutch-winner.jpg>.
- 12 'Tiwi History', All 4 Adventure TV (series The Rugged North), 20 December 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eqvPjbw7mv8>.
- 13 W.C.H. Robert, *The Dutch Explorations, 1605-1756, of the North and Northwest Coast of Australia* (Amsterdam, 1973).
- 14 G. Reid, *A Picnic With the Natives: Aboriginal-European Relations in the Northern Territory to 1910* (Melbourne 1990), 97.
- 15 E. Venbrux, "'Quite Another World of Aboriginal Life": Indigenous People in an Evolving Museumscape', in *The Future of Indigenous Museums: Perspectives from the Southwest Pacific*, ed. N. Stanley (New York, 2007), 117-134.
- 16 <http://tiwilandcouncil.com>.
- 17 C. Scott-Clark and A. Levy, 'Land of the Dead: How Did Two Tiny Islands Off Australia's North Coast Come to Have the Highest Suicide Rate in the World?', *The Guardian*, 24 June 2006, <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2006/jun/24/australia.adrianlevy>.
- 18 E. Venbrux, "'Wild and Barbaric Manners": The Exotic Encountered in a Dutch Account of Australian Aborigines in 1705', *Netherlands Yearbook for History of Art* 53(2002): 161-180.
- 19 E. Venbrux, *A Death in the Tiwi Islands: Conflict, Ritual and Social Life in an Australian Aboriginal Community* (Cambridge, 1995), 46-57.
- 20 T. Swain, *A Place for Strangers: Towards a History of Aboriginal Being* (Cambridge, 1993), 25.
- 21 T. Swain and G. Trompf, *The Religions of Oceania* (London, 1995), 33.
- 22 E. Venbrux, *A Death in the Tiwi Islands: Conflict, Ritual and Social Life in an Australian Aboriginal Community* (Cambridge, 1995), 187.
- 23 Robert, *The Dutch Explorations*, 141; cf. Zwaerdecroon and Chastelijn, 'Verslag eener reis naar de Noordkust van Nieuw Holland in 1705', 197.
- 24 Ibid.
- 25 Venbrux, 'Quite Another World of Aboriginal Life', 121-122.
- 26 Venbrux, *A Death in the Tiwi Islands*, 108.
- 27 D. Wood, 'Timber Deal In With Tiwi Is Jobs', *NT News*, 11 February 2014. <http://www.ntnews.com.au/news/northern-territory/timber-deal-chips-in-with-tiwi-is-jobs/story-fnkob1zt-1226824010629>.
- 28 Zwaerdecroon and Chastelijn, 'Verslag eener reis naar de Noordkust van Nieuw Holland in 1705', 198.
- 29 Ibid.
- 30 Robert, *The Dutch Explorations*, 141.
- 31 Ibid.
- 32 Cf. H. Reynolds, *The Other Side of the Frontier: Aboriginal Resistance to the European Invasion of Australia* (Ringwood, Vic., 1990), 27-29.
- 33 Robert, *The Dutch Explorations*, 143.
- 34 Zwaerdecroon and Chastelijn, 'Verslag eener reis naar de Noordkust van Nieuw Holland in 1705', 199.
- 35 E. Venbrux, 'Indigenous Religion in an Intercultural Space', in *Pulling the Right Threads: The Ethnographic Life and Legacy of Jane C. Goodale*, ed. L. Zimmer-Tamakoshi and J. Dickerson-Putman (Urbana, 2008), 168-186.
- 36 D.P. Fry and P. Söderberg, 'Lethal Aggression in Mobile Forager Bands and Implications for the Origins of War', *Science* 341(2013): 270-273.

---

Remembering and Reconstructing  
the Past in Brazil  
[p. 133]

---

- 1 P. Montero, *Entre o mito e a história: as comemorações em torno do v centenário do descobrimento da América* (Petrópolis, 1996); W. Albuquerque, *Algararra nas ruas. Comemorações da Independência na Bahia, 1889-1923* (Campinas, 1999).
- 2 R. Bastide, 'Mémoire collective et sociologie du bricolage', *L'Année Sociologique* 21 (1970): 65-108, a study inspired by M. Halbwachs.

- 3 M. Rörig Assunção, *Capoeira* (London, 2005).
- 4 Bastide, 'Mémoire collective'.
- 5 S. Capone, *La quête d'Afrique dans le candomblé* (Paris, 1999), 237-70; D. De G. Brown, *Umbanda: religion and politics in urban Brazil* (Ann Arbor, 1986).
- 6 J. Murilo de Carvalho, *A formação das almas: o imaginário da república no Brasil* (São Paulo, 1990), 55-74.
- 7 J. Murilo de Carvalho, 'The Unfinished Republic', *The Americas* 48 (1991): 139-57, 139.
- 8 N. Sevcenko, *Orfeu extático na metrópole. São Paulo, cultura e sociedade nos frementes anos. 20* (São Paulo, 1992): 98-9.
- 9 D. Williams, *Culture Wars in Brazil: The First Vargas Regime, 1920-45* (Durham NC, 2001).
- 10 H. Kraay, 'Between Brazil and Bahia: Celebrating Dois de Julho in 19th c. Salvador', *Journal of Latin American Studies* 31 (1999): 255-86; Ruben Oliven, *Tradition Matters: modern gaúcho identity in Brazil*, trans. Carmen Chaves Tesser (New York, 1996).
- 11 J. Burdick, *Blessed Anastácia: Women, Race and Popular Christianity in Brazil* (New York and London, 1998).
- 12 E. Bosi, *Memória e sociedade – lembranças de velhos* (3rd edition., São Paulo, 1994).
- 13 R. Earle, 'Sobre Héroes y Tumbas: National Symbols in 19th-Century Spanish America', *Hispanic American Historical Review* 85 (2005): 375-416.
- 14 Quoted in: C. A. Perrone and C. Dunn, eds., *Brazilian popular music and globalization* (Gainesville, 2001), 41.
- 4 For the history of this monument, see: M.J. van Dam, 'Cornelis en Frederick de Houtman van Gouda: pioniers van de vaart op Oost-Indië', *De Schatkamer* 12:3 (1998): 65-102, 89-94.
- 5 <http://www.deweekkrant.nl/pages.php?page=2015641> (22-9-2015) See also: <http://rijksmonumenten.nl/monument/517576/monument-voor-cornelis-en-frederik-de-houtman/gouda/> (22-9-2015).
- 6 '1596 – 1880. Aan de gebroeders Cornelis en Frederik de Houtman. Inboorlingen en burgers van Gouda. Als grondleggers van het verbond van Nederland met Insulinde. Het dankbare nageslacht'.
- 7 'De eerste O.I. vaarders'. G.J. Vos, *Geïllustreerde handleiding bij onze beschavingsgeschiedenis in beeld* (Haarlem 1904). See also: [http://collectie.tropenmuseum.nl/default.aspx?idx=ALL&field=\\*&search=5976-1](http://collectie.tropenmuseum.nl/default.aspx?idx=ALL&field=*&search=5976-1) (22-9-2015) Compare with: J.H. Werkman, *Schoolplaten voor de Vaderlandsche Geschiedenis. Op de reede van Bantam, 1598* (Groningen/Den Haag, n.d.); J.W. de Jongh and H. Wagenvoort, *Schoolplaten voor de Vaderlandsche Geschiedenis. Op de reede van Bantam, 1598* (Groningen/Den Haag, n.d.); <http://history-wallcharts.eu/view/op-de-reede-van-bantam-1598> (22-9-2015).
- 8 <http://www.geheugenvannederland.nl/?/nl/items/MVC01:NVPH-1696> (22-9-2015).
- 9 V. Roeper, '24 juni 1596. De Houtman landt te Bantam', *Belissende Momenten uit de Vaderlandse Geschiedenis* (Zwolle, 2005).
- 10 J. Blokker, J. Blokker jr. and B. Blokker, *Het Vooroudergevoel. De vaderlandse geschiedenis. Met schoolplaten van J.H. Isings* (Amsterdam/Antwerpen, 2005), 160.
- 11 See amongst others: M. Bloembergen and M. Eickhoff, 'Decolonizing Borobudur: Moral engagements and the fear of loss. The Netherlands, Japan and (post-)colonial heritage politics in Indonesia', in *Sites, Bodies and Stories. A comparative approach to history and heritage in colonial and postcolonial Indonesia*, eds. S. Legêne, B. Purwanto, H. Schulte Nordholt (Singapore, 2015) 33-66; M. Bloembergen and M. Eickhoff, 'Exchange and the protection of Java's antiquities; A transnational approach to the problem of heritage in colonial Java', *Journal of Asian Studies* 72:4 (2013): 1-24; M. Bloembergen and M. Eickhoff, 'Con-

---

Re-embarking for 'Banten'. The Sultanate that Never Really Surrendered [p. 140]

---

- 1 E. Vanvugt, *Nieuw Zwartboek van Nederland Overzee. Wat iedere Nederlander moet weten* (Soesterberg, 2011), 95-98.
- 2 J. Van Goor, *Jan Pieterszoon Coen 1587-1629. Koopman-koning in Azië* (Amsterdam, 2015) 513-524. See also: <http://www.rtvnh.nl/nieuws/61897/beeld-jan-pieterszoon-coen-valt-van-sokkel-met-video> (22-9-2015).
- 3 <http://historiek.net/nieuwe-tekst-op-sokkel-jan-pieterszoon-coen/15249/> (22-9-2015).

- serving the past, mobilizing the Indonesian future. Archaeological sites, regime change and heritage politics in Indonesia in the 1950s', *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* (BKI) 167:4 (December 2011): 405-426.
- 12 D. Chakrabarty, 'Postcoloniality and the Artifice of History', in: *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Difference* (Revised edition; Princeton, 2008), 3-23, 7.
- 13 M. Bloembergen and M. Eickhoff, 'A Wind of Change on Java's Ruined Temples. Archaeological Activities, Imperial Circuits and Heritage Awareness in Java and the Netherlands (1800-1850)', *BMGN – Low Countries Historical Review* 128:2 (2013): 81-104. <http://www.bmg-nlchr.nl/articles/abstract/10.18352/bmg-nlchr.8356/> (22-9-2015).
- 14 W. Lodewycksz, *De eerste schipvaart der Nederlanders naar Oost-Indië onder Cornelis de Houtman 1595-1597*; in opdracht van den raad van Beheer van het Koloniaal Instituut in het kort beschreven door G.B. Hooijer en overeenkomstig diens ontwerp, door Louis J. Vreugde gebeeldhouwd in de vestibule van het museum in het instituut te Amsterdam (Amsterdam, 1925); M. Bloembergen, *Colonial Spectacles: The Netherlands and the Dutch East Indies at the World* (Singapore, 2006), 298.
- 15 For the 'nationalisation' of the 'European' colonial project after 1945, see: S. Legêne and M. Eickhoff, 'Postwar Europe and the Colonial Past in Photographs', in *Transnational Memory. Circulation, Articulation, Scales. Media and Cultural Memory*, eds. C. De Cesari and A. Rigney, vol. 19 (Berlin/Boston, 2014), 287-311.
- 16 For this history, see: J. Talens, *Een feodale samenleving in koloniaal vaarwater. Staatsvorming, koloniale expansie en economische onderontwikkeling in Banten, West-Java (1600-1750)* (Hilversum, 1999).
- 17 E.B. Kielstra, 'Het Bantamsch Sultanaat', *Onze Eeuw* 10 (1916): 84-105, 102-103.
- 18 J.A. van der Chijs, 'Oud-Bantam', *Tijdschrift voor Indische Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 26 (1881): 1-62, 39.
- 19 *Ibid.*, 39.
- 20 *Ibid.*, 43.
- 21 V.I. van de Wall, *Banten en zijn historische bouwvallen*. (Lezing met lichtbeelden gehouden voor de Bestuurschool op Maandag 24 November 1930 te 6 ½ u.v.m.) (Batavia, n.d.), 5-6.
- 22 E.B. Kielstra, 'Het Bantamsch Sultanaat', *Onze Eeuw* 10 (1916): 84-105, 105; V.I. van de Wall, *Korte Gids voor de oudheden van Oud-Banten*. Met een voorwoord over de andere bezienswaardigheden van het regentschap Serang door R.T.A.A. Soeria Nata Atmadja (Regent van Serang) (2nd ed., Batavia n.d.), 23. For the history of the Sultanate Banten in the nineteenth century, see: J.J.P. de Jong, *De waaier van fortuin. De Nederlanders in Azië en de Indonesische archipel 1595-1950* (Den Haag, 1998), 184-185.
- 23 C.W.M. van de Velde, *Gezigten uit Neêrlands-Indie naar de natuur getekend en beschreven* (Amsterdam, 1843-46), 11-12.
- 24 S.A. Buddingh, *Neêrlands-Oost-Indië. Reizen over Java, Madura, Makassar, [...]: gedaan gedurende het tijdvak van 1852-1857*, 3 vols. (Rotterdam, 1859-1861), 79.
- 25 *Ibid.*, 77.
- 26 L. Serrurier, 'Kaart van Oud-Banten. Met eene inleiding van Dr. J. Brandes', *Tijdschrift voor Indische Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 45 (1902): 257-262.
- 27 A. Djajadiningrat, *Herinneringen van pangeran Aria Achmad Djajadiningrat* (Amsterdam/Batavia, n.d.), 228-229, 228. On the great grandmother, and on local memories about Banten that also inspired Achmad's brother Hoesein: G. Pijper, 'Professor pangeran Ario Hoesein Djajadiningrat, 8 december 1888-12 December 1960', *BKI* 117:4 (1961): 401-9, 401.
- 28 V.I. van de Wal, 'Bouwgeschiedenis van het Fort Speelwijk te Banten', *Oudheidkundig Verslag* 1928 (1929), 137-157, 154-155.
- 29 *Ibid.*, 157.
- 30 P.J. Perquin, 'Herstellingswerken der Sultansgraven te Pakalangan, Pangkalan Angka en Kanari (Bantam)', *Oudheidkundig Verslag* (1913): 107-109.
- 31 See for a description of such visits, and the role of local Bantenese elites therein: A. Djajadiningrat, *Herinneringen van pangeran Aria Achmad Djajadiningrat* (Amsterdam/Batavia, n.d.), 12.
- 32 H. Djajadiningrat, *Critische beschouwing van de Sedjarah Banten. Bijdrage ter kenschetsing van de Javaansche geschiedschrijving* (Haarlem, 1913); G. Pijper, 'Professor pangeran Ario

Hoesein Djajadiningrat, 8 december 1888-12 December 1960', *BKI* 117:4 (1961): 401-9.

33 H. Djajadiningrat, 'Iets over Banten en de Banteners', *Handelingen van het Eerste Congres voor de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van Java, Solo, 25-26 December 1919* (Weltevreden, 1921), 309-324.

34 'Uit de Provincie. Naar Oud-Banten', *Het nieuws van den dag voor Nederlandsch-Indië*, 17-II-1930.

35 V.I. van de Wall, *Korte Gids voor Oud-Banten* (Batavia, 1930) 4, 23.

36 V.I. van de Wall, *Korte Gids voor de oudheden van Oud-Banten*. Met een voorwoord over de andere bezienswaardigheden van het regentschap Serang door R.T.A.A. Soeria Nata Atmadja (Regent van Serang (2nd edition, Batavia, n.d.) 23.

37 V.I. van de Wall, Banten en zijn historische bouwvallen. (Lezing met lichtbeelden gehouden voor de Bestuurschool op Maandag 24 November 1930 te 6 ½ u.v.m.) (Batavia, n.d.), 5-6.

38 R.T.A.A. Soeria Nata Atmadja 'Voorwoord', in *Korte Gids voor de oudheden van Oud-Banten*. Met een voorwoord over de andere bezienswaardigheden van het regentschap Serang door R.T.A.A. Soeria Nata Atmadja (Regent van Serang), V.I. van de Wal (2nd edition, Batavia, n.d.) 3-16, 4.

39 Martijn Eickhoff visited and studied the site 10-6-2014.

40 See for example: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2013/04/20/historic-grand-mosque-get-new-look.html> (16-9-2015).

41 For the history and collection of this museum, see: H.M. Ambary, H. Michrod and J.M. Miksic, *Katalogus Koleksi Data Arkeologi Banten* (Jakarta, 1988).

42 For a comparable perspective, see: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/1999/07/10/banten-abounds-archeological-treasures.html> (22-9-2015).

43 [http://www.museumnasional.or.id/collections/etnografi/gamelan\\_suka\\_rame.html](http://www.museumnasional.or.id/collections/etnografi/gamelan_suka_rame.html) (15-6-2015) The objects have the inventory numbers: 1243-1256.

44 Visit to the Museum Nasional of M. Eickhoff (3-1-2015).

45 H. Groot, *Van Batavia naar Weltevreden. Het Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen, 1778-1867* (Leiden, 2009), 274.

46 M. Lane, *Unfinished Nation. Indonesia Before and After Suharto* (London, 2008), 13.

47 C. Guillot, H.M. Ambary and J. Dumarçay, *The Sultanate of Banten* (Jakarta, 1990), 8. For the many uprisings in the region since the abolishment of the Sultanate, see: S. Kartodirdjo, *The peasants' revolt of Banten in 1888; Its conditions, course and sequel: A case study of social movements in Indonesia* ('s-Gravenhage, 1966); M.C. Williams, *Sickle and crescent; The Communist revolt of 1926 in Banten* (Ithaca, 1982); M.C. Williams, *Communism, religion, and revolt in Banten* (Athens/Ohio, 1990).

48 <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2013/05/15/banten-called-revive-sultanate-legacy.html> (22-9-2015).

49 Ibid.

50 Ibid.

---

The Fabrication of Memory.  
The NAMES Project AIDS Quilt  
[p. 149]

---

1 An earlier version of this material can be found in P.S. Hawkins, 'Naming Names: The Art of Memory and the NAMES Project AIDS Quilt', *Critical Inquiry* 19:4 (1993): 752-779. I am grateful to the University of Chicago and the *CI* editors for its reuse here. See also my related essay on the Quilt, 'Stitches in Time', *Yale Review* 83:3 (1995): 1-15.

2 See A. Borg, *War Memorials: From Antiquity to the Present* (London, 1991).

3 P. Tauber, 'Monument Maker', *New York Times Magazine* (24-02-1990), <http://www.nytimes.com/1991/02/24/magazine/monument-maker.html>.

4 For Lin's intention that the Wall be read like an ancient epic, see: J.L. Swerdlow, 'To Heal a Nation', *National Geographic* 167 (May 1985): 571. About the arrangement of the names on the granite tablets, see: Tauber, 'Monument Maker'. Photographic images of the Wall can be found at: <https://www.google.com/search?q=vietnam+veterans+memorial&biw=1094&bih>.

5 Swerdlow, 'To Heal a Nation', 571.

6 S. Lopes, *The Wall: Images and Offerings from the Vietnam Veterans Memorial* (New York, 1987).

7 C. Blair, M.S. Jepperson, and E. Pucci, Jr.,



'Public Memorializing in Post-Modernity: the Vietnam Veterans Memorial as a Prototype', *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 77 (1991): 263-88. Although the authors mention the NAMES Quilt only in passing as 'an important successor' of the VWM, their study provides reasons for linking the two memorials more closely on the basis of the 'refusal of universal models' and 'embrace of pluralistic objectives' (266-7).

8 For these Cleve Jones quotes and an excellent account of the Quilt's origins and relationship both to the VWM and quilting, see: M. Sturken, 'Conversations with the Dead: Bearing Witness in the AIDS Memorial Quilt', in *Tangled Memories: The Vietnam War, the AIDS Epidemic, and the Politics of Remembering* (Berkeley, 1997), 183-219. See also: P. Mainardi, *Quilts: the Great American Art* (San Pedro, 1998).

9 *E pluribus enum*, 'one out of many', was the motto proposed for the first Great Seal of the United States by John Adams, Benjamin Franklin, and Thomas Jefferson in 1776.

10 For myriad images of the NAMES Project Quilt – both of individual panels and of larger displays – see: <https://www.google.com/search?q=NAMES+Project+Quilt++images&biw=1094&bih=562&tbm=isch&tbo=u&source=univ&sa=X&ei=prcVVZH2BKnfsAS38oKgDw&ved=0CDQQ7Ak&dpr=0.9>.

11 See E. Hess, 'Vietnam: Memorials of Misfortune', in *Unwinding the Vietnam War: From War into Peace*, ed. Reese Williams (Seattle, 1987), 262-79.

12 C. Jones, 'Address Given at the Lincoln Memorial', unpublished material distributed by the NAMES Project. The larger quote can be found in my 'Naming Names', 760.

13 On the ritual, quasi-liturgical practices that accompanied the Washington displays of the Quilt, see: C. Ruskin, *The Quilt: Stories from the Names Project* (New York, 1988), 137-45; and *Common Threads* [video recording]: *Stories from the Quilt* (New York: Distributed by New Yorker Video, 2004); J. Weinberg, 'Advertisement for the Dead', *Ambition & Love in Modern American Art* (New Haven, 2001), 242-74; T. Peter morial as a Prototype', D. Mohr, 'Text(ile): Reading the NAMES Project's AIDS Quilt', *Gay Ideas: Outing and Other Controversies* (Boston, 1992), 105-28.

14 <http://greatseal.com/mottoes/unum.html>; <http://www.ushistory.org/documents/pledge.html>.

15 <http://www.aidsquilt.org/about/the-names-project-foundation>.

---

Encounters Erased: tracing Indo-Dutch connected histories and their textual echoes, c. 1630-1670  
[p. 155]

---

1 The term 'Hindu' will be used sparingly. The Dutch authors discussed in this article predominantly (but not exclusively) described Vaisnava mythology, in particular those of the ten avatars of Vishnu as drawn from versions of the Bhāgavata and Harivaṃśa Purāṇas, but believed themselves to be referring to a more complete religious complex. For complications associated with the term, see: D. Lorenzen, 'Who Invented Hinduism?', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 41:4 (1999): 630-59.

2 The original manuscript currently resides in the Norbertine monastery at Postel, Belgium. A copy, made in 1962 by Piet Pott, can be consulted in the Leiden University Library as KITLV manuscript H771. A critical edition of the manuscript was recently published with an English translation: C. Stolte, *Philip Angel's Deex-Autaers: Vaisnava Mythology from Manuscript to Book Market in the Context of the Dutch East India Company, c. 1600-1672* (New Delhi, 2012).

3 Leiden University, Bibliotheca Publica Latina, Mss 2881, 't Leven der Heydense Benjanen'. These passages have also been included in the recent edition cited above.

4 Stolte, *Philip Angel's Deex-Autaers*, 312.

5 Ibid.

6 For an elaboration of the former point, see: P. Mitter, *Much Maligned Monsters: A History of European Reactions to Indian Art* (Chicago, 1977).

7 O. Dapper, *Asia, of een Naukeurige Beschijving van het Rijk des Grooten Mogols en een groot gedeelte van Indien* (Amsterdam, 1672).

8 Stolte, *Philip Angel's Deex-Autaers*, 318.

9 B.G. Gokhale, *Surat in the Seventeenth Century: a Study of Urban History of Premodern India* (London and Malmö, 1979), 75.



- 10 Few international travel guides mention Dabhoi today, and this author has not been able to locate one that mentions the Karnali temple.
- 11 Stolte, *Philip Angel's Deex-Autaers*, 109.
- 12 The first to point to a common source for Baldaeus and Dapper's parts on Indian religions was De Jong in 1917. Charpentier first pointed to a specific manuscript, a copy of Angel's manuscript currently in the British Library as the anonymous Sloane Manuscript 3290. Pott put Angel's name to this common source but was unaware of Charpentier's findings. Respectively: Ph. Baldaeus, *Afgoderye der Oost-Indische Heydenen*, ed. A.J. De Jong (Den Haag, 1917); J. Charpentier, 'The Brit. Mus. Ms. Sloane 3290, The Common Source of Baldaeus and Dapper', in *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies, University of London*, 3:3 (1924): 413-420; P.H. Pott, *Naar Wijder Horizon: Kaleidoscoop op ons beeld van de buitenwereld* (The Hague, 1962), 58.
- 13 Ph. Baldaeus, *Afgoderye der Oost-Indische Heydenen, zijnde een ware en nauwkeurige verhandeling van den godtsdienst der Indostansche, Choromandelse, Malabarsche en Cheylonsche heydenen, hoe dezelve af-gebeelt en geëert werden* (Amsterdam, 1672). For a more elaborate account of the way Dapper and Baldaeus dealt with Angel's text, see: Stolte, *Philip Angel's Deex-Autaers*, 84-98.
- 14 D. de Wever, ed., *Rijklof van Goens' Javaanse Reyse* (Amsterdam, 1995).
- 15 G. Carolinus, *Het Hedendaagse Heydendom, of Beschrijving van den Godsdienst der Heidenen, so als die nu en enige jaren herwaarts in de drie deelen van de Oude bekende Wereld, namelijk Asia, Africa en enige gewesten van Europa bevonden is en noch geoeffent word... alles uit verscheide Auteuren te samen getrocken* (Amsterdam, 1661).
- 16 Stolte, *Philip Angel's Deex-Autaers*, 96.
- 17 A. Kircher, *China Monumentis Illustrata* (Antwerp, 1667); A. Rogerius, *De open-deure tot het verborgen heydendom ofte waerachtigh vertoogh van het leven ende zeden; mitsgaders de religie, ende godsdienst der Bramines, op de cust Chormandel, ende de landen daar ontrent* (Leiden, 1651).
- 18 'Getrocken uyt der heidenen wetboek zelf.' Dapper, *Asia*, 84.
- 19 BL, SMC 1820, *Livro da Seita dos Indios Orientais*, anonymous. Identified and published by Jarl Charpentier as *The Livro da Seita dos Indios Orientais* (Brit. Mus. Ms. Sloane 1820) of Father Jacobo Fenicio, S.J., edited with an introduction and notes by Jarl Charpentier (Uppsala, 1933).
- 20 Angel departed from Gamron (Bandar Abbas) on 20 September 1655. The journey to Surat would have taken around six weeks in that season. Angel finished his manuscript in 1657, which year is mentioned in the text. There is no record of his departure for Batavia, but given that the manuscript was dedicated to Hartsink on 26 March 1658, this allows for a maximum of two years in Surat.
- 21 For an elaboration of this point, see C. Stolte, 'Onbekend en Onbemind: over de 'anonimiteit' van lokale medewerkers in zeventiende-eeuws India', in ed. Lodewijk Wagenaar, *Aan de Overkant. Ontmoetingen in dienst van de VOC en WIC (1600-1800)* (Leiden, 2015), 207-26.
- 22 A few authors do go into his local contacts: D.F. Lach and E.J. van Kley, *Asia in the Making of Europe: A Century of Advance*, vols. 2-3 (Chicago, 1998), 102-30; S. Arasaratnam, 'Protestant Christianity and South Indian Hinduism, 1630-1730: Some Confrontations in Society and Belief', *Indian Church History Review* 15:1 (1981): 7-33.
- 23 A. Rogerius, *De Open-deure tot het Verborgen Heydendom door Abraham Rogerius*, ed. W. Caland (Den Haag, 1915), xxxvi.
- 24 *Ibid.*, 16-7.
- 25 Ph. Baldaeus, *Naauwkeurige beschryvinge van Malabar en Choromandel, der zelve aangrenzende ryken, en het machtige eyland Ceylon; Nevens een omstandige en grondigh door-zochte ontdekking en wederlegginge van de afgoderye der Oost-Indische heydenen* (Amsterdam, 1672), 192.
- 26 *Ibid.*, 193.
- 27 M. Beumer, 'Philippus Baldaeus en Gerrit Mosopatam: een buitengewoon portret', *Bulletin van het Rijksmuseum* 47:2-3 (1999): 144-173.
- 28 For other examples of this world of seventeenth century interaction, see: J. Gommans, 'Nederlandse schilders in de Oost: Een hypothese', in *Het Verre Gezicht. Politiek en relaties tussen Nederland en Azië, Afrika en Amerika: Opstellen aangeboden aan prof. dr.*

Leonard Blussé, eds. Thomas Lindblad and Alicia Schrikker (Franeker, 2011), 66-88; S. Subrahmanyam, *Courtly Encounters: Translating Courtliness and Violence in Early Modern Eurasia* (Cambridge, MA, 2012), 154-210.  
29 Pierre Nora, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire', *Representations* 26 (1989): 7-24, 19.  
30 *Ibid.*, 22.

---

Japanese World Maps between East and West  
[p. 164]

---

1 M. Sato, 'Imagined Peripheries: the world and its peoples in Japanese cartographic imagination', in *Facing Each Other: the world's perception of Europe and Europe's perception of the world*, ed. A. Pagden (Aldershot, 2000), 367-93, 370-1.  
2 K. Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', in *The History of Cartography*, vol. 2, no. 2, *Cartography in the Traditional East and Southeast Asian Societies*, eds. J.B. Harley and D. Woodward (Chicago, 1994), 346-477, 369-73.  
3 Sato, 'Imagined Peripheries', 369-70.  
4 J.H. Loh, 'When Worlds Collide: art, cartography, and Japanese Nanban world map screens' (Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 2013), chapter 4.  
5 J. Goss, *The Mapmaker's Art: a history of cartography* (London, 1993), 174-7; D. Crouch, ed., *Cartography IV* (London, 2009), 92-7; M.J. Wintle, 'Seeing Europe from Elsewhere: a continent in words and pictures', in *United in Visual Diversity: images and counter-images of Europe*, eds. B. Drechsel and C. Leggewie (Innsbruck, 2010), 199-213, 206.  
6 Loh, 'When Worlds Collide'.  
7 Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 347, 377-80.  
8 *Ibid.*, 405-10.  
9 Loh, 'When Worlds Collide', chapter 5.  
10 Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 377 and 390.  
11 H. Beukers, et al., eds., *Red-Hair Medicine: Dutch-Japanese medical relations* (Amsterdam, 1991).  
12 Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 432-43, 443.  
13 I discussed this map and the *Bankoku* one in figure 1 briefly in: M.J. Wintle, ed., *Imagining Europe: Europe and European civilisation as*

*seen from its margins and by the rest of the world* (Brussels, 2008), 36-7.

14 The obvious should go on the record here: I rely on the maps partly because I cannot read the written Japanese texts. Fortunately the secondary sources in English concerning the principal cartographic events, as cited here in the notes, are quite extensive and reliable.  
15 Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 347, 349.  
16 Sato, 'Imagined Peripheries', 368.  
17 Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 454.  
18 Loh, 'When Worlds Collide'.  
19 Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 426-8, 439-40.  
20 Useful comment on Shuyi Chen's blog, <http://blog.richmond.edu/lives-of-maps/2014/10/21/map-of-the-week-a-world-in-a-color-book/>, accessed 11-02-2015.  
21 Sato, 'Imagined Peripheries', 373.  
22 Kazutaka Unno, 'Cartography in Japan', 435.

#### iv Europe (De)constructed

---

Left Behind in Translation? The Image of Augustus in Asia Minor  
[p. 176]

---

1 It is a pleasure to contribute to a volume in honour of Peter Rietbergen. His teaching and research has always crossed chronological and geographical boundaries. Even if this article stays firmly rooted in Roman history, I hope that the discussion of the links between political geography and identity may be of interest to him.  
2 B. Salway, 'The Roman Empire: Augustus to Diocletian', in *Roman Europe*, ed. E. Bispham (Oxford, 2008), 69-108, 72-3.  
3 Appian, *Civil War*, 5.1.1, with: O. Hekster and T. Kaizer, 'Mark Antony and the raid on Palmyra: reflections on Appian, *Bella Civilia* V.9.', *Latomus* 63 (2004): 70-80, with further references.  
4 D. Petrain, 'The Archaeology of the Epigrams from the *Tabulae Iliacae*: Adaptation, Allusion, Alteration', *Mnemosyne* 65 (2012): 597-635, 600-614

- 5 Petrain, 'The Archaeology of the Epigrams', 610-1, referring to Suetonius, *Augustus* 18.1 and 50; Dio 51.16.5 and Pliny, *Natural History* 37.10.
- 6 J. Isager, 'Alexander the Great in Roman Literature from Pompey to Vespasian', in *Alexander the Great: Reality and Myth*, ed. J. Carlsen (Rome, 1993), 75-84, 79.
- 7 M. Squire, *The Iliad in a Nutshell: Visualizing Epic on the Tabulae Iliacae* (Oxford/New York, 2011), 58-60.
- 8 Cf. A. Wallace-Hadrill, *Rome's Cultural Revolution* (Cambridge, 2008), 315-355.
- 9 F. Millar, *The Roman Near East. 31 BC-AD 337* (Cambridge, MA, 1993) remains seminal. The term 'Parthian Near West' was coined by: R. Fowler, 'Most Fortunate Roots': Tradition and legitimacy in Parthian royal ideology', in *Imaginary Kings. Royal Images in the Ancient Near East, Greece and Rome*, eds. O. Hekster and R. Fowler (Stuttgart, 2005), 125-155, 128.
- 10 S. Matterns, 'The defeat of Crassus and the Just War', *The Classical World* 96 (2003): 387-396, with references.
- 11 B. Campbell, 'War and diplomacy: Rome and Parthia, 31 BC-AD 235', *War and Society in the Roman World*, eds. John Rich and Graham Shipley (London/New York, 1993), 213-240, 214-220.
- 12 Ch. B. Rose, 'The Parthians in Augustan Rome', *American Journal of Archaeology* 109 (2005): 21-75, 22, with nn. 9-10 for further references.
- 13 Suetonius, *Life of Augustus*, 29.2; Dio 54.8.3; Ovid, *Fasti*, 5.569-96; M. Spannagel, *Exemplaria Principis. Untersuchungen zu Entstehung und Ausstattung des Augustusforums* (Heidelberg, 1998), 41-72; J. Rich, '"Augustus" Parthian honours, the temple of Mars Ultor and the arch in the Forum Romanum', *Papers of the British School at Rome* 56 (1988): 71-128.
- 14 *Roman Imperial Coinage* (London, 1984) vol. I, 82 no. 505-510; *Roman Provincial Coinage* (London, 1992), 2216-20; B. Burrell, *Neokoroi. Greek Cities and Roman Emperors* (Boston, 2004), 17-22; Rose, 'The Parthians in Augustan Rome', 24-25; B. Weisser, 'Pergamum as paradigm', in *Coinage and Identity in the Roman Provinces*, eds. Ch. Howgego, V. Heuchert and A. Burnett (Oxford, 2005), 135-142, 135-136.
- 15 Rose, 'The Parthians in Augustan Rome', 54-57, 57.
- 16 H. Halfmann, *Itinera Principum. Geschichte und Typologie der Kaiserreisen im Römischen Reich* (Stuttgart, 1986), 154-158.
- 17 J. Munk Højte, *Roman Imperial Statue Bases from Augustus to Commodus* (Aarhus, 2005), figs. C1, G1.
- 18 See still: S. Price, *Rituals and Power. The Roman Imperial Cult in Asia Minor* (Cambridge, 1984), notwithstanding the criticism by: I. Gradel, *Emperor Worship and Roman Religion* (Oxford, 2002).
- 19 O. Hekster, *Emperors and Ancestors. Roman Rulers and the Constraints of Tradition* (Oxford, 2015), 117, 243-245.
- 20 S. Price, 'Local mythologies in the Greek East', in *Coinage and Identity in the Roman Provinces*, 115-124, 122-123.
- 21 A. Burnett, 'The Augustan Revolution Seen from the Mints of the Provinces', *Journal of Roman Studies* 101 (2011): 1-30, 14, with references.
- 22 On the RGDA, see now especially: P. Arena, *Augusto. Res Gestae. I miei atti* (Bari, 2014) and A. Cooley, *Res Gestae Divi Augusti. Text, Translation, and Commentary* (Cambridge, 2009).
- 23 Suetonius, *Life of Augustus*, 101.4; Dio Cassius, 56.33.1.
- 24 A recent very fragmentary Greek inscription has been identified by: P. Thonemann, 'A copy of Augustus' Res Gestae at Sardis', *Historia* 61 (2012): 280-288 as part of a further unknown copy of the Res Gestae – the first recorded outside of Galatia.
- 25 Cooley, *Res Gestae Divi Augusti*, 26-29.
- 26 Thonemann, 'A copy of Augustus' Res Gestae at Sardis', 287-288.
- 27 Cooley, *Res Gestae Divi Augusti*, 6-18, with Thonemann, 'A copy of Augustus' Res Gestae at Sardis', 288 proposing that the Sardis copy of the Res Gestae would have been placed on the municipal temple of Augustus there.
- 28 Virgil's *Aeneid* book I.279.

- 1 P. Hazard, *La crise de la conscience européenne, 1680-1715* (Paris, 1935; edition of 1961), 15-18.
- 2 L. van Lieshout, *The Making of Pierre Bayle's Dictionnaire Historique et Critique* (Amsterdam/Utrecht, 2001), 176.
- 3 *Ibid.*, 73, 177 and 251.
- 4 See E. Said, *Orientalism*, (London, 1978) and the cultural-historical observations concerning the concepts 'Orient' and 'orientalisme' in the valedictory speech: *Tekenen des Tijds* by W.J. van der Dussen, Open Universiteit (Heerlen, 2005).
- 5 J. Israel, *Contested Enlightenment. Philosophy, Modernity and the Emancipation of Man, 1670-1752* (Oxford, 2006), chapter 24.
- 6 See also: P. Joxe's, 'Bayle, 'Mahomet' et l'Islam', in *Le Rayonnement de Bayle*, ed. Ph. De Robert (with Claudine Pailhès and Hubert Bost) (Oxford, 2010), 165-172.
- 7 A precept that in fact is not so difficult for the Asiatic races as it is for those of the North, and which would have meant that the Willibrords and Bonifaces would certainly have stranded. Nevertheless it is problematic in all wine-producing countries, and from ancient and modern history we know that the beverage does not displease the Orientals.
- 8 I will only add here that they have numerous fine precepts concerning the obligations of individual persons towards their fellow-creatures, precepts that even lay down the rules for civilized behavior. They have also put down in writing how one should behave towards a sovereign, and one of their maxims states that it is never permitted to kill him, or to speak evil of him with the pretext that he is a tyrant.
- 9 The *remarques* M, N, O and P.
- 10 Admittedly, the kings of France have spread Christianity to the land of the Frisians and the Saxons in Muhammadan fashion. They have used the same violence for the propagation of their faith in the North. The self-same methods have been applied against sects that dared condemn the Pope. In India they act in the same way, if they are given the

chance, and from all this it is clear that no charges against Mohammed can be distilled from the circumstance that he spread his religion by coercion.

- 11 Bayle devotes an important article to the philosopher Averroes and also the entry Takkidin is interesting for its treatment of the influence of philosophy upon the Islam.
- 12 The first three authors wonder whether the document is perhaps counterfeit, but Claudius Salmasius maintains that it is definitely authentic; see notes 138, 139, 149 and 143 going with *remarque* AA.
- 13 On account of their religious doctrine the Muslims are obliged to use violence to destroy other religions, but nevertheless they have been tolerating those for many centuries. The Christians have only been ordered to preach and to teach, but yet from time immemorial they have extirpated by fire and sword all those who do not adhere to their faith.
- 14 It can be stated as a fact that, if the Western Christians would have been in charge in Asia instead of the Saracens and Turks, there would now be no trace left of the Greek Church and that they would not have tolerated the Islam, as those unbelievers have actually done with respect to the Christians.
- 15 For this conclusion see *remarque* AA: 'La conclusion de tout ceci est que les hommes se conduisent peu selon leurs principes. Voilà les Turcs qui tolèrent toutes sortes de religions, quoique l'Alcoran leur ordonne de persécuter les infidèles, et voilà les chrétiens qui ne font que persécuter quoique l'évangile le leur défende.'
- 16 P. Joxe, 'Bayle, 'Mahomet' et l'Islam', 168; cfr. N. Striker, *Die maskierte Theologie von Pierre Bayle* (Berlin/New York, 2003).
- 17 P. Rétat, 'Les notes du 'Dictionnaire' de Bayle', in *Les notes de Voltaire. Une écriture polyphonique*, ed. N. Cronk and C. Mervaud (Oxford, 2003), 41, and: H. Bost, *Pierre Bayle* (Paris, 2006), 404-406.
- 18 J. Israel, 'Bayle's double Image during the Enlightenment', in *Pierre Bayle (1647-1706. Le Philosophe de Rotterdam, Philosophy, Religion and Reception*, ed. W. van Bunge and H. Bots (Leiden/Boston, 2008), 135-151.
- 19 J. Israel, *Radical Enlightenment* (Oxford, 2001), 702-703.
- 20 Used to being in a state of permanent

doubt and to formulating such doubts ingeniously, he was not able to dissolve those doubts and as he did not find the evident and irrefutable truths people so often speak of, he remained uncertain. Heaven was clouded for him and he did not succeed in dissipating the fog. It was not that he completely lacked faith, but on various points his faith was brittle.

See: M. Silvera, *Corrispondenza da Rotterdam, 1685-1709* (Amsterdam/Maarssen, 2000), 245, letter of 3 -01-1707, written a few days after his death on 28 December 1706. See also: *ibid.*, xlii-xliv.

21 See A. McKenna, 'Pierre Bayle in the twentieth Century', in *ibid.*, 253-267, 260-261: 'Bayle played a major role in the diffusion of a peculiar kind of Spinozism' and according to Israel the spinozistic materialism formed the mainstream within the Radical Enlightenment. It seems to me that in adopting this view Israel is going much too far. In this matter the publications of G. Mori could also be mentioned.

22 J. Israel, *Enlightenment Contested*, 617. This concerns especially Boulainvilliers in his *La Vie de Mahomed* (Amsterdam, 1730) and Voltaire.

23 See for instance: P. Bayle, *Nouvelles de la République des Lettres*, with an article on J. Chardin, September 1686, art. viii; and even more so in the *Bibliothèque Raisonnée des Ouvrages des Savants de l'Europe*, the article about *La Vie de Mahomed*, 1732., t. 8, sec. partie, art. 5. This periodical contains many articles about the Middle-East.

---

The Beauties of a Continent. Historical Images of Europe in Smaller and Bigger Data [p. 190]

---

1 *Nieuwe Tilburgsche Courant* (7-2-1931).

2 *Leeuwarder nieuwsblad* (29-12-1928).

3 *Het Vaderland* (10-04-1929).

4 *De Waarheid* (27-06-1957).

5 *Friese koerier* (05-06-1964).

6 <http://www.delpher.nl/nl/kranten>.

7 J. van Eijnatten, J. Verheul, T. Pieters, 'Ts Tools: Using Texcavator to Map Public Discourse', *Ts: Tijdschrift voor Tijdschriftstudies* 35 (2014): 59-65 (<http://dspace.library.uu.nl/handle/1874/304584>).

8 *Nieuwe Tilburgsche Courant* (15-04-1935).

9 E.g. 'Het lot van schoonheidskoninginnen', *Veritas. Katholiek 14-daagsch blad voor Maastricht* (04-03-1939).

10 'Mysterieuze verdwijning op de "Paris". Is Frank Vosper over boord gevallen?', *De Telegraaf* (07-03-1937).

11 *Soerabaijasch Handelsblad* (19-04-1929).

12 *Het Vaderland* (5-2-1931).

13 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (28-06-1931).

14 *Soerabaijasch Handelsblad* (29-03-1930).

15 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (24-10-1930).

16 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (10-07-1930).

17 *Voorwaarts* (08-07-1930).

18 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (2-12-1930).

19 *De Telegraaf* (27-01-1931).

20 *De Telegraaf* (25-01-1931).

21 *Amigoe di Curacao* (02-07-1927).

22 *De Sumatra post* 10(-6-1931).

23 *De Sumatra post* (2-3-1931).

24 *De Indische Courant* (21-01-1931).

25 *Bataviaasch Nieuwsblad* (11-05-1937).

26 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (26-05-1930).

27 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (21-7-1930).

28 *De Tijd* (28-11-1930).

29 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (01-04-1930).

30 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (14-6-1931).

31 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (29-03-1930).

32 *De Telegraaf* (01-05-1931).

33 Cf. Sabine Wilke, *From Kafka to Sebald. Modernism and Narrative Form* (New York, 2012).

34 *Soerabaijasch Handelsblad* (15-07-1933).

35 *Algemeen Handelsblad* (29-09-1931). For Eelsing, see <http://resources.huylens.knaw.nl/zendingoverzeesekerken/Repertorium-VanNederlandseZending-EnMissie-archieven1800-1960/gids/bijlage/bijlage2> (consulted 05-12-2014).

---

Postcolonial Memories. Frantz Fanon in/on Europe [p. 199]

---

1 'Fuck Europe'. M. Renault, *Frantz Fanon. De l'anticolonialisme à la critique postcoloniale* (Paris, 2011), 182.

2 'You need to use your imagination to understand that: your imagination, or your memory.' F. Fanon, *Les damnés de la terre* (Paris, 2002), 295.



- 3 P. Nora ed., *Les Lieux de mémoire* (Paris 1984-1986).
- 4 M. Rothberg, 'Introduction: Between Memory and Memory: From Lieux de mémoire to Nœuds de mémoire', *Yale French Studies* 118/119 (2010): 3-12.
- 5 Cf. P. Nora, *Les Français d'Algérie*. Édition revue et augmentée. Avec un document inédit de Jacques Derrida (Paris, 2012; first French edition 1961); P. Nora, *Historien Public* (Paris, 2011), 33-141.
- 6 H.K. Bhabha, 'Foreword to the 1986 Edition', in *Black skin, white masks*, ed. F. Fanon (London/York, 2008), xi-xxxvii.
- 7 D. Caute, *Frantz Fanon* (London, 1970); P. Geismar, *Fanon* (New York, 1971); I.L. Gendzier, *Frantz Fanon. A Critical Study* (New York, 1973); A. Cherki, *Frantz Fanon. A Portrait* (first French edition 2000); D. Macey, *Frantz Fanon: A Biography* (New York/Verso, 2000). Renate Zehar compiled a bibliographic essay: *L'Oeuvre de Frantz Fanon* (Paris, 1970).
- 8 E. Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (New York, 1993); H. Bhabha, 'Foreword; Framing Fanon', in *The Wretched of the Earth*, ed. F. Fanon (New York, 2004), viii-xli, translated from French by Richard Philcox. With commentary by Jean Paul Sartre and Homi Bhabha. See also Leila Aboulela's novel *The Translator* (1999) and Tom Wolfe's *A Man in Full* (1998).
- 9 J. Fanon, *Frantz Fanon. My Brother: Doctor, Playwright* (Lanham, 2014; originally published as: *Frantz Fanon. De la Martinique à l'Algérie et à l'Afrique*. Paris, 2004), 17.
- 10 D. Constantini, *Mission civilisatrice. Le rôle de l'histoire coloniale dans la construction de l'identité politique française* (Paris, 2008), 225. This is reminiscent of the famous essay by Roland Barthes on French military nationalism wherein a picture with a young black soldier (*un jeune nègre vêtu d'un uniforme français*) in the Paris-Match represents 'La France' as 'an empire that honours all its sons that serve the nation without distinction': R. Barthes, 'Le mythe, aujourd'hui', in: Idem, *Mythologiques* (Paris, 1957), 180-211.
- 11 'Un jour on a décidé de le tuer, parce que les Européens ils veulent tuer tous les Algériens.' In: F. Fanon, *Les damnés de la terre* (Paris, 2002), 259.
- 12 A. Ramdas and E. Said: 'Geen enkele Europese cultuur deze eeuw is zuiver', *De Groene Amsterdammer* (16-03-1994).
- 13 S. Bronwasser', *De Dood aan de keukentafel; recensie Overzichtstentoonstelling van de Finse Eija-Liisa Ahtila*, *De Volkskrant* (05-06-2008); Eija-Liisa Ahtila, *Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-Westfalen K21, Düsseldorf*.
- 14 M. Rothberg, *On Being a Descendant: Implicated Subjects and the Legacies of Slavery*. *Lecture, Rijksuniversiteit Utrecht*, (21 and 22-06-2013). M. Rothberg, 'Multidirectional memory and the implicated subject: On Sebald and Kentridge', in *Performing Memory in Art and Popular Culture*, eds. Liedeke Plate and Anneke Smelik (New York/London, 2013), 39-58.
- 15 M. Luckhurst, *Caryl Churchill* (New York, 2015), 48.
- 16 H. Abdilahi Bulhan, *Frantz Fanon and the Psychology of Oppression* (New York, 1985), chapter 4: 'Fanon and Eurocentric Psychology'.
- 17 Fanon, *Black skins*, 100. D. Chakrabarty, *Provincializing Europe: postcolonial thought and historical difference* (Princeton, 2000).
- 18 Macey, *Frantz Fanon*, 75.
- 19 Renault, *Frantz Fanon*, 179.
- 20 This is the chapter 5 'The Fact of Blackness' in the English translation; Macey, *Frantz Fanon*, 132.
- 21 Intro *Peau noire*.
- 22 M. Evans, *The Memory of the Resistance. French Opposition to the Algerian War (1954-192)* (Oxford/New York, 1997), 182; F. Fanon, *L'An v de la révolution algérienne (Sociologie d'une révolution)* (Paris, 1959).
- 23 M. Hewitson and M. D'Auria, *Europe in Crisis: Intellectuals and the European Idea, 1917-1957* (New York, 2012), 12; and T. Judt, *Postwar. A history of Europe since 1945* (New York, 2005), 7.
- 24 Macey, *Frantz Fanon*, 109.
- 25 M. Rothberg, *Multidirectional Memory. Remembering the Holocaust in the age of decolonization* (Stanford, 2009); Cf L. Dubois, 'An Enslaved Enlightenment: Rethinking the Intellectual History of the French Atlantic', *Social History* 31 (2006): 1-14.
- 26 In English translation: F. Bolkestein, *The Intellectual Temptation: Dangerous Ideas in Politics* (Bloomington, 2013). In a newspaper clipping by Samuel de Lange (*NRC Handelsblad*, 07-05-1999) Fanon's alleged vision on



## Sources of Illustrations

violence is associated with Sorel, Malraux and 'the epigone' Régis Debray.

27 C. Janssen, 'Het geweld kwam van links', *de Volkskrant*, (03-05-2003); J.-H. Bakker, 'Wereld zonder geweld is gevaarlijke illusie', *AD/Rivierenland* (01-11-2008).

28 A Dutch early adopter of the 'postcolonial Fanon' is the journalist Anil Ramdas (1958-2012), although as he wrote, 'Surinam could not be compared to Algeria' and 'the white people we encountered were even nicer and more leftist than ourselves'. A. Ramdas, 'De rebellen van tegenwoordig', (19-05-2011), [www.deburen.eu](http://www.deburen.eu) and Anil Ramdas, *De papegaai, de stier en de klimmende bougainvillea* (Amsterdam, 2000), 173-178. See also S. Sanders, *De Buitenwacht* (Amsterdam 1996).

29 F. Laroui, 'Ook Rachid en Fatima zijn Europeanen', *De Groene Amsterdammer* (25-08-2010).

30 Attention for *Peau noire* returns in the current documentary *Black Skin White Masks* (1995) by Isaac Julien and in the adaptation of the book for the stage by the Belgian director Ivan Vrambout. cf. on *Les damnés de la terre*, the documentary *Concerning Violence* (2014) by Göran Olsson.

31 H. Dabashi, *Can Non-Europeans think?*, (15-01-2013) <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2013/01/2013114142638797542.html>; and, idem, *Can Non-Europeans think?* (London, 2015).

32 T. Lemaire, *Twijfel aan Europa. Zijn de intellectuelen de vijanden van de Europese cultuur?* (Baarn, 1990).

Catholic Documentary Centre, Nijmegen (ALFO 26-18) 113l

Classical Numismatic Group 1210

Ludo Everts 112

Martijn Eickhoff 118b

Mission Museum, Steyl 104, 117

Museo de América, Madrid (inv.no. 101) 108

Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes de Argentina 109

Public Domain 99, 110, 1110, 114, 115, 116b, 1160, 119l, 119r, 120b, 1200, 122, 1230, 166, 167, 169, 170, 171

Stadsarchief Blankenberge 111b

Tropenmuseum, Amsterdam 1180

University Library Radboud University (KDC c 23079) 113r